

DISCLAIMER

The following is a preliminary report of actions taken by the House of Delegates at its 2023 Interim Meeting and should not be considered final. Only the Official Proceedings of the House of Delegates reflect official policy of the Association.

AMERICAN MEDICAL ASSOCIATION HOUSE OF DELEGATES (I-23)

Report of Reference Committee on Amendments to Constitution and Bylaws

Po-Yin Samuel Huang, MD, Chair

1 Your Reference Committee recommends the following consent calendar for acceptance:

2
3 **RECOMMENDED FOR ADOPTION**

- 4
5 1. BOT Report 01 – Employed Physicians
6 2. BOT Report 10 - Medical Decision-Making Autonomy of the Attending Physician
7 3. BOT Report 17 - Specialty Society Representation in the House of Delegates—
8 Five-Year Review
9 4. Resolution 006 - Inappropriate Use of Health Records in Criminal Proceedings

10
11 **RECOMMENDED FOR ADOPTION AS AMENDED**

- 12
13 5. Resolution 002 – Support for International Aid for Reproductive Health
14 6. Resolution 007- Improving Access to Forensic Medical Evaluations and Legal
15 Representation for Asylum Seekers
16 7. Resolution 004 – Reconsideration of Medical Aid in Dying (MAID)

17
18 **RECOMMENDED FOR REFERRAL**

- 19
20 8. CEJA Report 01 - Physicians' Use of Social Media for Product Promotion and
21 Compensation
22 9. CEJA Report 02 - Research Handling of De-Identified Patient Data
23 10. Resolution 009 - Physicians Arrested for Non-Violent Crimes While Engaged in
24 Public Protests

25
26 **RECOMMENDED FOR NOT ADOPTION**

- 27
28 11. Resolution 005 – Adopting a Neutral Stance on Medical Aid in Dying

29
30
31 **Amendments**

32 **If you wish to propose an amendment to an item of business, click here: [SUBMIT](#)**
33 **[NEW AMENDMENT](#)**

RECOMMENDED FOR ADOPTION

- 1
2
3 (1) BOARD OF TRUSTEES REPORT 01 – EMPLOYED
4 PHYSICIANS

5
6 **RECOMMENDATION:**
7

8
9 **Your Reference Committee recommends that**
10 **recommendations in Board of Trustees Report 1 be**
11 **adopted and the remainder of the Report be filed.**

12
13 **HOD ACTION: Recommendations in Board of**
14 **Trustees report 01 adopted and the remainder**
15 **of the Report be filed.**
16

17 The Board of Trustees recommends that the following recommendation be adopted in
18 lieu of the recommendations of BOT Report 09-I-22 and that the remainder of this report
19 be filed:

20
21 That our AMA re-examine the representation of employed physicians within the
22 organization and report back at the 2024 Annual Meeting.

23
24 Testimony was heard in unanimous support. Online testimony was also in
25 unanimous support. Your Reference Committee recommends that BOT Report
26 01 be adopted.

- 27
28 (2) BOARD OF TRUSTEES REPORT 10 – MEDICAL
29 DECISION-MAKING AUTONOMY OF THE ATTENDING
30 PHYSICIAN

31
32 **RECOMMENDATION:**
33

34
35 **Your Reference Committee recommends that**
36 **recommendations in Board of Trustees Report**
37 **10 be adopted and the remainder of the Report**
38 **be filed.**

39
40 **HOD ACTION: Recommendations in**
41 **Board of Trustees Report 10 adopted**
42 **and remainder of the Report filed.**
43
44

45 In light of the foregoing, your Board of Trustees recommends that the:
46 1. First, second, and third resolve clauses of Resolution 009-I-22, "Medical Decision-
47 Making Autonomy of the Attending Physician" not be adopted; and
48 2. Fourth resolve clause of Resolution 009-I-22 be adopted with amendment as
49 follows:

1 That our AMA ~~aggressively pursue~~ continue to strongly oppose any encroachment of
2 administrators upon the medical decision making of attending physicians that is not in
3 the best interest of patients ~~as strongly as possible, for there is no more sacred~~
4 ~~relationship than that of a doctor and his/her patient, and as listed above, first, we do no~~
5 ~~harm.~~ (Directive to Take Action)
6
7

8 Testimony was heard in unanimous support. Online testimony was also in
9 unanimous support. Your Reference Committee recommends that BOT Report
10 10 be adopted.
11

12
13 (3) BOARD OF TRUSTEES REPORT 17 – SPECIALITY
14 SOCIETY REPRESENTATION IN THE HOUSE OF
15 DELEGATES-FIVE YEAR REVIEW
16

17 **RECOMMENDATION:**
18

19 **Your Reference Committee recommends that**
20 **recommendations in the Board of Trustees**
21 **Report 17 be adopted and the remainder of the**
22 **Report be filed.**
23

24 **HOD ACTION: Recommendations in the**
25 **Board of Trustees Report 17 adopted**
26 **and the remainder of the Report be filed.**
27
28

29 The Board of Trustees recommends that the following be adopted, and the remainder of
30 this report be filed:
31

32 1. The American Academy of Ophthalmology, Inc., American Academy of Orthopaedic
33 Surgeons, American Academy of Otolaryngology—Head and Neck Surgery, American
34 Academy of Pain Medicine, American Academy of Pediatrics, American Academy of
35 Physical Medicine and Rehabilitation, American Association of Neurological Surgeons,
36 and Society of Nuclear Medicine and Molecular Imaging retain representation in the
37 American Medical Association House of Delegates. (Directive to Take Action)
38

39 2. Having failed to meet the requirements for continued representation in the AMA
40 House of Delegates as set forth in AMA Bylaw B-8.5 the American Academy of Allergy,
41 Asthma & Immunology be placed on probation and be given one year to work with AMA
42 membership staff to increase their AMA membership. (Directive to Take Action)
43

44 Testimony was heard in unanimous support. Your Reference Committee
45 recommends that BOT Report 17 be adopted.

1 (4) RESOLUTION 006 – INAPPROPRIATE USE OF HEALTH
2 RECORDS IN CRIMINAL PROCEEDINGS
3

4 **RECOMMENDATION:**
5

6 **Your Reference Committee recommends that**
7 **Resolution 006 be adopted.**
8

9 **HOD ACTION: Resolution 006 adopted**
10
11
12

13 RESOLVED, that our American Medical Association encourage collaboration with
14 relevant parties, including state and county medical societies, the American College of
15 Correctional Physicians, and the American Bar Association, on efforts to preserve
16 patients' rights to privacy regarding medical care while incarcerated while ensuring
17 appropriate use of medical records in parole and other legal proceedings to protect
18 incarcerated individuals from punitive actions related to their medical care. (New HOD
19 Policy)
20

21 Testimony was heard in unanimous support. Your Reference Committee
22 recommends that Resolution 006 be adopted.

RECOMMENDED FOR ADOPTION AS AMENDED

(5) RESOLUTION 002 – SUPPORT FOR INTERNATIONAL
AID FOR REPRODUCTIVE HEALTH

RECOMMENDATION A:

**That the first resolve of Resolution 002 be amended by
addition and deletion as follows:**

**RESOLVED, that our American Medical Association
oppose restrictions on U.S. funding to non-
governmental organizations which solely because they
provide reproductive health care internationally,
including but not limited to contraception and abortion
care (New HOD Policy); and it be further**

RECOMMENDATION B:

**That the second resolve of Resolution 002 be amended
by addition and deletion as follows:**

**RESOLVED, that our AMA supports funding for global
humanitarian and non-governmental organizations
assistance for maternal healthcare comprehensive
reproductive health services, including but not limited
to contraception and abortion care. (New HOD Policy)**

RECOMMENDATION C:

**Your Reference Committee recommends that
Resolution 002 be adopted as amended.**

**HOD ACTION: Resolution 002 adopted as
amended.**

RESOLVED, that our American Medical Association oppose restrictions on U.S. funding to non-governmental organizations which provide reproductive health care internationally, including but not limited to contraception and abortion care (New HOD Policy); and it be further

RESOLVED, that our AMA supports global humanitarian assistance for maternal healthcare and comprehensive reproductive health services, including but not limited to contraception and abortion care. (New HOD Policy)

Testimony was generally supportive including for a proffered amendment.
Testimony cited the need to support our physicians who practice globally and

1 that the recommendation aligns with existing policy. Your Reference Committee
2 recommends that Resolution 002 be adopted as amended.

- 3
4 (6) RESOLUTION 007 – IMPROVING ACCESS TO
5 FORENSIC MEDICAL EVALUATIONS AND LEGAL
6 REPRESENTATION FOR ASYLUM SEEKERS

7
8 **RECOMMENDATION A:**

9
10 **That Resolution 007 be amended by deletion as**
11 **follows:**

12
13 **~~RESOLVED, that our American Medical Association~~**
14 **~~support public funding of legal representation for~~**
15 **~~people seeking legal asylum (New HOD Policy); and be~~**
16 **~~it further~~**

17
18 **RESOLVED, that our AMA support efforts to train and**
19 **recruit physicians to conduct medical and psychiatric**
20 **forensic evaluations for all asylum seekers through**
21 **existing training resources, including, but not limited**
22 **to, the Asylum Medicine Training Initiative. (New HOD**
23 **Policy)**

24
25 **RECOMMENDATION B:**

26
27 **Your Reference Committee recommends that**
28 **Resolution 007 be adopted as amended.**

29
30 **HOD ACTION: Resolution 007 referred.**

31
32 **RESOLVED, that our American Medical Association support public funding of legal**
33 **representation for people seeking legal asylum (New HOD Policy); and be it further**
34

35 **RESOLVED, that our AMA support efforts to train and recruit physicians to conduct**
36 **medical and psychiatric forensic evaluations for all asylum seekers through existing**
37 **training resources, including, but not limited to, the Asylum Medicine Training Initiative.**
38 **(New HOD Policy)**
39

40 Testimony was mixed. There were concerns raised about the first resolve clause
41 because it was outside the purview of the AMA. Online testimony suggested
42 amendment by deletion of specific reference to “Asylum Medicine Training
43 Initiative” to avoid specific program references. Your Reference Committee
44 recommends that Resolution 007 be adopted as amended.

1 (7) RESOLUTION 004 – RECONSIDERATION OF MEDICAL
2 AID IN DYING (MAID)

3
4 **RECOMMENDATION A:**

5
6 **That Resolution 004 be amended by deletion.**

7
8 **RESOLVED, that our American Medical Association**
9 **oppose criminalization of physicians and health**
10 **professionals who engage in medical aid in dying at a**
11 **patient's request and with their informed consent, and**
12 **oppose civil or criminal legal action against patients**
13 **who engage or attempt to engage in medical aid in**
14 **dying (New HOD Policy); and be it further**

15
16 ~~**RESOLVED, that our AMA use the term “medical aid in**~~
17 ~~**dying” instead of the term “physician-assisted**~~
18 ~~**suicide” and accordingly amend HOD policies and**~~
19 ~~**directives, excluding Code of Medical Ethics opinions**~~
20 ~~**(New HOD Policy)**~~

21
22 ~~**RESOLVED, that our AMA rescind our HOD policies on**~~
23 ~~**physician-assisted suicide, H-270.965 “Physician-**~~
24 ~~**Assisted Suicide” and H-140.952 “Physician Assisted**~~
25 ~~**Suicide,” while retaining our Code of Medical Ethics**~~
26 ~~**opinion on this issue (Rescind HOD Policy)**~~

27
28
29 **RECOMENDATION B:**

30
31 **Your Reference Committee recommends that**
32 **alternative Resolve 4 be adopted in lieu of current**
33 **Resolve 4:**

34
35 **RESOLVED, that our AMA amend H-140.966**
36 **“Decisions Near the End of Life” by deletion as**
37 **follows, while retaining our Code of Medical Ethics**
38 **opinions on these issues:**
39 **Decisions Near the End of Life, H-140.966**
40 **Our AMA believes that: (1) The principle of patient**
41 **autonomy requires that physicians must respect the**
42 **decision to forgo life-sustaining treatment of a patient**
43 **who possesses decision-making capacity. Life-**
44 **sustaining treatment is any medical treatment that**
45 **serves to prolong life without reversing the underlying**
46 **medical condition. Life-sustaining treatment includes,**
47 **but is not limited to, mechanical ventilation, renal**
48 **dialysis, chemotherapy, antibiotics, and artificial**
49 **nutrition and hydration.**

1 (2) There is no ethical distinction between withdrawing
2 and withholding life-sustaining treatment.

3 (3) Physicians have an obligation to relieve pain and
4 suffering and to promote the dignity and autonomy of
5 dying patients in their care. This includes providing
6 effective palliative treatment even though it may
7 foreseeably hasten death. More research must be
8 pursued, examining the degree to which palliative care
9 reduces the requests for euthanasia or assisted
10 suicide.

11 (4) Physicians must not perform euthanasia ~~or~~
12 ~~participate in assisted suicide~~. A more careful
13 examination of the issue is necessary. Support,
14 comfort, respect for patient autonomy, good
15 communication, and adequate pain control may
16 decrease dramatically the public demand for
17 euthanasia ~~and assisted suicide~~. In certain carefully
18 defined circumstances, it would be humane to
19 recognize that death is certain and suffering is great.
20 However, the societal risks of involving physicians in
21 medical interventions to cause patients' deaths is too
22 great to condone euthanasia ~~or physician-assisted~~
23 ~~suicide~~ at this time.

24 (5) Our AMA supports continued research into and
25 education concerning pain management. (Modify
26 Current HOD Policy)

27
28 **RECOMMENDATION C:**

29
30 Your Reference Committee recommends that the fifth
31 Resolve of 004 be referred.

32
33 **RECOMMENDATION D:**

34
35 Your Reference Committee recommends that
36 Resolution 004 be adopted as amended.

37
38 **RECOMMENDATION E:**

39
40 Your Reference Committee recommends a title change
41 to Resolution 004 to read as follows:

42
43 **STUDY OF PHYSICIAN ASSISTED SUICIDE AND**
44 **MEDICAL AID IN DYING**

45
46 **HOD ACTION: First Resolve of Resolution 004**
47 **amended by addition and deletion as follows:**

48
49 **RESOLVED, that our American Medical**
50 **Association ~~oppose criminalization of~~**

1 ~~physicians and health professionals who~~
2 ~~engage in medical aid in dying at a patient's~~
3 ~~request and with their informed consent, and~~
4 ~~oppose civil or criminal legal action against~~
5 ~~patients who engage or attempt to engage in~~
6 ~~medical aid in dying (New HOD Policy); and be~~
7 ~~it further~~

8
9 RESOLVED, that our AMA oppose criminal or
10 civil legal action against physicians and health
11 professionals who engage, or attempt to
12 engage in providing a lethal dose of medication
13 for terminally ill patients to use at such time as
14 the patient sees fit, and oppose civil or criminal
15 legal action against patients for using
16 medications prescribed with this intent; and be
17 it further

18
19 RESOLVED, that our AMA study alternative
20 terminology such as "End of Life Expanded
21 Treatment Options" rather than either the term
22 "Physician Assisted Suicide" or "Medical Aid in
23 Dying", both of which have historically been
24 considered objectionable by various groups of
25 physicians and are therefore divisive.

26
27 HOD Action: Amended Resolution 004 referred.
28
29
30

31 RESOLVED, that our American Medical Association oppose criminalization of physicians
32 and health professionals who engage in medical aid in dying at a patient's request and
33 with their informed consent, and oppose civil or criminal legal action against patients
34 who engage or attempt to engage in medical aid in dying (New HOD Policy); and be it
35 further

36
37 RESOLVED, that our AMA use the term "medical aid in dying" instead of the term
38 "physician-assisted suicide" and accordingly amend HOD policies and directives,
39 excluding Code of Medical Ethics opinions (New HOD Policy)

40
41 RESOLVED, that our AMA rescind our HOD policies on physician-assisted suicide, H-
42 270.965 "Physician-Assisted Suicide" and H-140.952 "Physician Assisted Suicide," while
43 retaining our Code of Medical Ethics opinion on this issue (Rescind HOD Policy)

44
45 RESOLVED, that our AMA amend H-140.966 "Decisions Near the End of Life" by
46 deletion as follows, while retaining our Code of Medical Ethics opinions on these issues:
47 Decisions Near the End of Life, H-140.966

48 Our AMA believes that: (1) The principle of patient autonomy requires that physicians
49 must respect the decision to forgo life-sustaining treatment of a patient who possesses
50 decision-making capacity. Life-sustaining treatment is any medical treatment that serves

1 to prolong life without reversing the underlying medical condition. Life-sustaining
2 treatment includes, but is not limited to, mechanical ventilation, renal dialysis,
3 chemotherapy, antibiotics, and artificial nutrition and hydration.

4 (2) There is no ethical distinction between withdrawing and withholding life-sustaining
5 treatment.

6 (3) Physicians have an obligation to relieve pain and suffering and to promote the dignity
7 and autonomy of dying patients in their care. This includes providing effective palliative
8 treatment even though it may foreseeably hasten death. More research must be
9 pursued, examining the degree to which palliative care reduces the requests for
10 euthanasia or assisted suicide.

11 ~~(4) Physicians must not perform euthanasia or participate in assisted suicide. A more
12 careful examination of the issue is necessary. Support, comfort, respect for patient
13 autonomy, good communication, and adequate pain control may decrease dramatically
14 the public demand for euthanasia and assisted suicide. In certain carefully defined
15 circumstances, it would be humane to recognize that death is certain and suffering is
16 great. However, the societal risks of involving physicians in medical interventions to
17 cause patients' deaths is too great to condone euthanasia or physician-assisted suicide
18 at this time.~~

19 (5) Our AMA supports continued research into and education concerning pain
20 management. (Modify Current HOD Policy)

21
22 RESOLVED, that our AMA study changing our existing position on medical aid in dying,
23 including reviewing government data, health services research, and clinical practices in
24 domestic and international jurisdictions where it is legal. (Directive to Take Action)

25
26 Mixed testimony was heard, with a significant amount of testimony both in
27 support and in opposition.

28
29 Your Reference Committee heard mixed but supportive testimony for resolve 1 to
30 protect physicians from criminalization and did not hear any direct opposition to
31 this resolve. Therefore, your Reference Committee recommends adoption of
32 resolve 1.

33 Your Reference Committee heard impassioned but mixed testimony regarding
34 resolves 2 through 5. Therefore, your Reference Committee thinks further study
35 is warranted and is recommending referral of resolve 5 so that this may be
36 accomplished. Until this study can be concluded, your Reference Committee
37 recommends resolves 2 and 3 not be adopted and alternative resolve 4 be
38 adopted until evidence-based information can be evaluated. Therefore, your
39 Reference Committee recommends Resolution 004 be adopted as amended with
40 a title change.

1 **RECOMMENDATION FOR REFERRAL**

2
3
4 (8) COUNCIL ON ETHICAL AND JUDICIAL AFFAIRS
5 REPORT 01 – PHYSICIANS’ USE OF SOCIAL MEDIA
6 FOR PRODUCT PROMOTION AND COMPENSATION

7
8 **RECOMMENDATION:**

9
10 **Your Reference Committee recommends that**
11 **the recommendations in Council on Ethical and**
12 **Judicial Affairs Report 01 be referred back to**
13 **CEJA.**

14
15 **HOD ACTION: Recommendations in**
16 **Council on Ethical and Judicial Affairs**
17 **Report 01 referred back to CEJA.**
18
19

20 In consideration of the foregoing, the Council on Ethical and Judicial Affairs recommends
21 that:

22 Opinion 9.6.4, “Sale of Health-Related Products,” and Opinion 9.6.5, “Sale of Non-
23 Health-Related Products” be consolidated and amended by substitution to read as
24 follows:

25 The sale or promotion of products or services by physicians may offer benefit to patients
26 or the public but may also conflict with their professional ethical responsibilities. Whether
27 intended or not, they may be perceived to use their professional knowledge and stature
28 as inducements to consumers. There are four key scenarios of sales or promotion: (1)
29 health-related products or services marketed to patients, (2) health-related products or
30 services marketed to the general public, (3) non-health-related product or services
31 marketed to patients, and (4) non-health-related products or services marketed to the
32 general public.

33 Of greatest concern are commercial practices in which physicians sell or promote goods
34 or services to patients. In these circumstances patients may feel pressured to purchase
35 the product or service, which may compromise the physician’s fiduciary obligation to put
36 patients’ interests above their own financial interests and undermine the trust that
37 grounds patient-physician relationships. Similarly, if physicians lend their credibility as
38 medical professionals to products or services that are not supported by peer-reviewed
39 evidence or are of questionable value they may put patient well-being and the integrity of
40 the profession in jeopardy.

41 Physicians and medical students therefore should:

42 Refrain from leveraging their professional role to promote unrelated business ventures.

43 Fully disclose the nature of their financial interest in the product or service.

44 Avoid exclusive distributorship arrangements that make products or services available
45 only through the individual’s commercial venue.

46 Limit the sale or promotion of health-related goods or services only to those that serve
47 the immediate needs of patients and strive to make the product or service available at a
48 reasonable cost.

49 Refrain from the sale or promotion of non-health-related goods or services as a regular
50 part of their professional activities. (Modify HOD/CEJA Policy); and

1
2 2. Opinion 2.3.2, "Professionalism in the Use of Social Media" be amended by
3 substitution to read as follows: Social media—internet-enabled communication
4 technologies—enable individual medical students and physicians to have both a
5 personal and a professional presence online.
6 Social media can foster collegiality and camaraderie within the profession as well as
7 provide opportunities to disseminate public health messages and other health
8 communication widely. However, use of social media by medical professionals can also
9 undermine trust and damage the integrity of patient-physician relationships and the
10 profession as a whole, especially when medical students and physicians use their social
11 media presence to promote personal interests.
12 Physicians and medical students should be aware that they cannot realistically separate
13 their personal and professional personas entirely online and should curate their social
14 media presence accordingly. Physicians and medical students therefore should:
15 Use caution when publishing any content that could damage their individual professional
16 reputation or impugn the integrity of the profession.
17 (b) Respect professional standards of patient privacy and confidentiality and refrain from
18 publishing identifiable patient information online. When they use social media for
19 educational purposes or to exchange information professionally with other physicians or
20 medical students they should follow ethics guidance regarding confidentiality, privacy,
21 and informed consent.
22 (c) Maintain appropriate boundaries of the patient-physician relationship in accordance
23 with ethics guidance if they interact with patients through social media, just as they
24 would in any other context.
25 (d) Use privacy settings to safeguard personal information and content, but be aware
26 that once on the Internet, content is likely there permanently. They should routinely
27 monitor their social media presence to ensure that their personal and professional
28 information and content published about them by others is accurate and appropriate.
29 Disclose any financial interests related to their social media content, including, but not
30 limited to, paid partnerships and corporate sponsorships.
31 (f) When using social media platforms to disseminate medical health care information,
32 ensure that such information is useful and accurate. They should likewise ensure to the
33 best of their ability that non-health-related information is not deceptive. (Modify
34 HOD/CEJA Policy); and
35 3. The remainder of this report be filed.

36
37 Testimony was mixed, but the majority supported referral. Testimony in support
38 suggested that these were appropriate recommendations that do not actually
39 prohibit physicians from offering products for sale but instead offer suitable
40 guidelines concerning how to do so in an ethical manner. Testimony in opposition
41 asked CEJA to reconsider recommendations concerning exclusive distributorship
42 since these might negatively affect innovation. It was suggested that the
43 language requiring that products meet the "immediate" needs of patients should
44 be changed to include long-term healthcare needs as well. Some testimony
45 pointed out that there are practice models in place that would be restricted by
46 these recommendations, and that since reimbursement is declining, it is a benefit
47 to practices to be able to sell products to offset costs. It was also noted that the
48 recommendations concerning the use of social media for educational purposes

1 seem to imply that informed consent is required in that context even when it is
2 not possible to obtain it. Your Reference Committee recommends that CEJA
3 Report 01 be referred.

4
5 (9) COUNCIL ON ETHICAL AND JUDICIAL AFFAIRS
6 REPORT 02 – RESEARCH HANDLING OF DE-
7 IDENTIFIED PATIENT DATA

8
9 **RECOMMENDATION:**

10
11 **Your Reference Committee recommends that**
12 **recommendations in Council on Ethical and**
13 **Judicial Affairs Report 02 be referred back to**
14 **CEJA.**

15
16 **HOD ACTION: Recommendations in Council on Ethical and Judicial**
17 **and Ethical and Judicial Affairs Report 02 referred back to CEJA.**
18

19 In light of the challenges considered with regard to constructing a framework for holding
20 stakeholders accountable within digital health information ecosystems, the Council on
21 Ethical and Judicial Affairs recommends:

22 1. That the following be adopted:

23 Within health care systems, identifiable private health information, initially derived from
24 and used in the care and treatment of individual patients, has led to the creation of
25 massive de-identified datasets. As aggregate datasets, clinical data takes on a
26 secondary promising use as a means for quality improvement and innovation that can be
27 used for the benefit of future patients and patient populations. While de-identification of
28 data is meant to protect the privacy of patients, there remains a risk of re-identification,
29 so while patient anonymity can be safeguarded it cannot be guaranteed. In handling
30 patient data, individual physicians thus strive to balance supporting and respecting
31 patient privacy while also upholding ethical obligations to the betterment of public health.
32 When clinical data are de-identified and aggregated, their potential use for societal
33 benefits through research and development is an emergent, secondary use of electronic
34 health records that goes beyond individual benefit. Such data, due to their potential to
35 benefit public health, should thus be treated as a form of public good, and the ethical
36 standards and values of health care should follow the data and be upheld and
37 maintained even if the data are sold to entities outside of health care. The medical
38 profession's responsibility to protect patient privacy as well as to society to improve
39 future health care should be recognized as inherently tied to these datasets, such that all
40 entities granted access to the data become data stewards with a duty to uphold the
41 ethical values of health care in which the data were produced.

42 As members of health care institutions, physicians should:

- 43
44 (a) Follow existing and emerging regulatory safety measures to protect patient privacy;
45 (b) Practice good data intake, including collecting patient data equitably to reduce bias in
46 datasets;
47 (c) Answer any patient questions about data use in an honest and transparent manner to
48 the best of their ability in accordance with HIPAA (or current legal standards).

1 Health care systems, in interacting with patients, should adopt policies and practices that
2 provide patients with transparent information regarding:

- 3 (d) The high value that health care institutions place on protecting patient data;
- 4 (e) The reality that no data can be guaranteed to be permanently anonymized, and that
- 5 risk of re-identification does exist;
- 6 (f) How patient data may be used and by whom;
- 7 (g) The importance of de-identified aggregated data for improving the care of future
- 8 patients.

9
10 Health care systems, as health data stewards, should:

- 11
- 12 (h) Establish appropriate data collection methods and practices that meet industry
- 13 standards to ensure the creation of high-quality datasets;
- 14 (i) Ensure proper oversight of patient data is in place, including provisions for the use of
- 15 de-identified datasets that may be shared, sold, or resold;
- 16 (j) Develop models for the ethical use of de-identified datasets when such provisions do
- 17 not exist, such as establishing and contractually requiring independent data ethics
- 18 review boards free of conflicts of interest to evaluate the sale and potential resale of
- 19 clinically-derived datasets;
- 20 (k) Take appropriate cyber security measures to ensure the highest level of protection is
- 21 provided to patients and patient data;
- 22 (l) Develop proactive post-compromise planning strategies for use in the event of a data
- 23 breach to minimize additional harm to patients;
- 24 (m) Advocate that health- and non-health entities using any health data adopt the
- 25 strongest protections and uphold the ethical values of the medical profession.

26
27 There is an inherent tension between the potential benefits and burdens of de-identified
28 datasets as both sources for quality improvement to care as well as risks to patient
29 privacy. Re-identification of data may be permissible, or even obligatory, in rare
30 circumstances when done in the interest of the health of individual patients. Re-
31 identification of aggregated patient data for other purposes without obtaining patients'
32 express consent, by anyone outside or inside of health care, is impermissible. (New
33 HOD/CEJA Policy); and

34
35 2. That Opinion 2.1.1, "Informed Consent"; Opinion 3.1.1, "Privacy in Health Care";
36 Opinion 3.2.4, "Access to Medical Records by Data Collection Companies"; and Opinion
37 3.3.2, "Confidentiality and Electronic Medical Records" be amended by addition as
38 follows:

39
40 a. Opinion 2.1.1, Informed Consent

41 Informed consent to medical treatment is fundamental in both ethics and law. Patients
42 have the right to receive information and ask questions about recommended treatments
43 so that they can make well-considered decisions about care. Successful communication
44 in the patient-physician relationship fosters trust and supports shared decision
45 making. Transparency with patients regarding all options of treatment is critical to
46 establishing trust and should extend to discussions regarding who has access to
47 patients' health data and how data may be used.

48 The process of informed consent occurs when communication between a patient and
49 physician results in the patient's authorization or agreement to undergo a specific
50 medical intervention. In seeking a patient's informed consent (or the consent of the

1 patient's surrogate if the patient lacks decision-making capacity or declines to participate
2 in making decisions), physicians should:

3 (a) Assess the patient's ability to understand relevant medical information and the
4 implications of treatment alternatives and to make an independent, voluntary decision.

5 (b) Present relevant information accurately and sensitively, in keeping with the patient's
6 preferences for receiving medical information. The physician should include information
7 about:

8 (i) the diagnosis (when known);

9 (ii) the nature and purpose of recommended interventions;

10 (iii) the burdens, risks, and expected benefits of all options, including forgoing treatment.

11 (c) Document the informed consent conversation and the patient's (or surrogate's)
12 decision in the medical record in some manner. When the patient/surrogate has
13 provided specific written consent, the consent form should be included in the record.

14 In emergencies, when a decision must be made urgently, the patient is not able to
15 participate in decision making, and the patient's surrogate is not available, physicians
16 may initiate treatment without prior informed consent. In such situations, the physician
17 should inform the patient/surrogate at the earliest opportunity and obtain consent for
18 ongoing treatment in keeping with these guidelines. (Modify HOD/CEJA Policy)

19 b. Opinion 3.1.1, Privacy in Health Care

20 Protecting information gathered in association with the care of the patient is a core value
21 in health care. However, respecting patient privacy in other forms is also fundamental,
22 as an expression of respect for patient autonomy and a prerequisite for trust.

23 Patient privacy encompasses a number of aspects, including personal space (physical
24 privacy), personal data (informational privacy), personal choices including cultural and
25 religious affiliations (decisional privacy), and personal relationships with family members
26 and other intimates (associational privacy).

27 Physicians must seek to protect patient privacy in all settings to the greatest extent
28 possible and should:

29 (a) Minimize intrusion on privacy when the patient's privacy must be balanced against
30 other factors.

31 (b) Inform the patient when there has been a significant infringement on privacy of
32 which the patient would otherwise not be aware.

33 (c) Be mindful that individual patients may have special concerns about privacy in any
34 or all of these areas.

35 (d) Be transparent that privacy safeguards for patient data are in place but acknowledge
36 that anonymity cannot be guaranteed and that breaches can occur notwithstanding best
37 data safety practices. (Modify HOD/CEJA Policy)

38 c. Opinion 3.2.4, Access to Medical Records by Data Collection Companies

39 Information contained in patients' medical records about physicians' prescribing
40 practices or other treatment decisions can serve many valuable purposes, such as
41 improving quality of care. However, ethical concerns arise when access to such
42 information is sought for marketing purposes on behalf of commercial entities that have
43 financial interests in physicians' treatment recommendations, such as pharmaceutical or
44 medical device companies.

45 Information gathered and recorded in association with the care of a patient is
46 confidential. Patients are entitled to expect that the sensitive personal information they
47 divulge will be used solely to enable their physician to most effectively provide needed
48 services. Disclosing information to third parties for commercial purposes without consent
49 undermines trust, violates principles of informed consent and confidentiality, and may
50 harm the integrity of the patient-physician relationship.

1 Physicians who propose to permit third-party access to specific patient information for
2 commercial purposes should:

3 (a) Only provide data that has been de-identified.

4 (b) Fully inform each patient whose record would be involved (or the patient's
5 authorized surrogate when the individual lacks decision-making capacity) about the
6 purpose(s) for which access would be granted.

7 Physicians who propose to permit third parties to access the patient's full medical record
8 should:

9 (c) Obtain the consent of the patient (or authorized surrogate) to permit access to the
10 patient's medical record.

11 (d) Prohibit access to or decline to provide information from individual medical records
12 for which consent has not been given.

13 (e) Decline incentives that constitute ethically inappropriate gifts, in keeping with ethics
14 guidance.

15 Because de-identified datasets are derived from patient data as a secondary source of
16 data for the public good, health care professionals and/or institutions who propose to
17 permit third-party access to such information have a responsibility to ensure that any use
18 of data derived from health care adhere to the ethical standards of the medical
19 profession. (Modify HOD/CEJA Policy)

20 d. Opinion 3.3.2, Confidentiality and Electronic Medical Records

21 Information gathered and recorded in association with the care of a patient is
22 confidential, regardless of the form in which it is collected or stored.

23 Physicians who collect or store patient information electronically, whether on stand-alone
24 systems in their own practice or through contracts with service providers, must:

25 (a) Choose a system that conforms to acceptable industry practices and standards with
26 respect to:

27 (i) restriction of data entry and access to authorized personnel;

28 (ii) capacity to routinely monitor/audit access to records;

29 (iii) measures to ensure data security and integrity; and

30 (iv) policies and practices to address record retrieval, data sharing, third-party access
31 and release of information, and disposition of records (when outdated or on termination
32 of the service relationship) in keeping with ethics guidance.

33 (b) Describe how the confidentiality and integrity of information is protected if the patient
34 requests.

35 (c) Release patient information only in keeping with ethics guidance for
36 confidentiality and privacy. (Modify HOD/CEJA Policy); and

37 3. That the remainder of this report be filed.

38

1 Testimony was overwhelmingly in support of referral. Testimony cited that the topic was
2 important but that issues related to informed consent, language regarding "all options"
3 as opposed to "medically appropriate" options, and language regarding the use of
4 "ensure" need to be reassessed. It was also noted that physicians cannot "ensure" that
5 data is used only in certain ways, since they are not in control of what happens to it at
6 the systems level. Some testimony opposed the claim that patients have a responsibility
7 or duty to provide their data for the purposes of public health, instead maintaining that
8 this was not obligatory but they could freely volunteer if they wished. Some testimony
9 also indicated that guidelines for the sale of patient data implied that such sales are
10 permissible when in reality they are a violation of confidentiality. It was asked that the
11 recommendations be revised to include some discussion of exclusive contracts for data
12 sharing that may inhibit innovation across whole areas of specialty. Your Reference
13 Committee recommends that CEJA Report 02 be referred.

1 (10) RESOLUTION 009 – PHYSICIANS ARRESTED FOR
2 NON-VIOLENT CRIMES WHILE ENGAGED IN PUBLIC
3 PROTESTS

4
5 **RECOMMENDATION:**

6
7 **Your Reference Committee recommends that**
8 **Resolution 009 be referred.**

9
10 **HOD ACTION: Resolution 009 referred.**

11
12
13 RESOLVED, that our American Medical Association advocate to appropriate
14 credentialing organizations and payers—including the Federation of State Medical
15 Boards, state and territorial licensing boards, hospital and hospital system accrediting
16 boards, and organizations that compensate physicians for provision of health care goods
17 and services—that misdemeanor or felony arrests of physicians as a result of exercising
18 their First Amendment rights of protest through nonviolent civil disobedience should not
19 be deemed germane to the ability to safely and effectively practice medicine. (Directive
20 to Take Action)

21
22 Testimony was mixed. Testimony suggested that advocating for patients requires
23 the ability to participate in nonviolent protests, and those who do so may find
24 themselves arrested and so face negative implications for their careers. Further,
25 testimony pointed out that the resolution only discusses arrests and not
26 convictions, and this distinction should be recognized. Testimony highlighted the
27 inconsistency in the severity of charges for the same activities in different
28 jurisdictions. Opposing testimony recommended referral because the
29 recommendation is overly broad and could allow those who spread medical
30 disinformation or falsely pose as reproductive health providers to be protected
31 from professional consequences. It was further noted that felonies maybe
32 different from misdemeanors and so the recommendations should be omitted
33 that suggest they are to be treated in an equivalent manner. Online testimony
34 proffered an amendment to add “employers” to the list entities. Your Reference
35 Committee recommends that Resolution 009 be referred.

RECOMMENDED FOR NOT ADOPTION

(11) RESOLUTION 005 – ADOPTING A NEUTRAL STANCE
ON MEDIAL AID IN DYING

RECOMMENDATION:

**Your Reference Committee recommends that
Resolution 005 be not adopted.**

**HOD ACTION: Resolution 005 not
adopted.**

RESOLVED, that our American Medical Association adopt a neutral stance on medical aid in dying and respect the autonomy and right of self-determination of patients and physicians in this matter. (New HOD Policy)

Resolution 005 was considered at the same time as Resolution 004. As stated previously, your Reference Committee heard extensive but mixed testimony on this topic. Therefore, Your Reference Committee has recommended in Resolution 004 that this issue be further studied. Your Reference Committee recommends that Resolution 005 be not adopted.

Madam Speaker, this concludes the report of Reference Committee on Amendments to Constitution and Bylaws. I would like to thank Dr. Joseph Adashek, Dr. Kenneth Andreoni, Dr. Cee Davis, Dr. Lisa Hatcher, Dr. Tate Hinkle, and Dr. Elana Sitnik and all those who testified before the committee.

Joseph Adashek, MD
Nevada State Medical Association

Kenneth Andreoni, MD
American Society of Transplant
Surgery

Cee Davis, MD, MPH
American College of OB/GYNs

Lisa Hatcher, MD
Indiana Medical Association

Tate Hinkle, MD, MPH
American Academy of Family Physicians

Elana Sitnik
Medical Student Section

Po-Yin Samuel Huang, MD
California Medical Association
Chair