AMERICAN MEDICAL ASSOCIATION HOUSE OF DELEGATES

Resolution: 304
(A-22)

Introduced by: Resident and Fellow Section

Subject: Accountable Organizations to Resident and Fellow Trainees

Referred to: Reference Committee C

Whereas, The stated mission of the Accreditation Council for Graduate Medical Education (ACGME) is to, “improve healthcare and population health by assessing and advancing the quality of resident physicians’ education through accreditation”; and

Whereas, To achieve its mission the ACGME has determined that it has two main purposes: “(1) to establish and maintain accreditation standards that promote the educational quality of residency and subspecialty training programs; and (2) to promote conduct of the residency educational mission with sensitivity to the safety of care rendered to patients and in a humane environment that fosters the welfare, learning, and professionalism of residents.”; and

Whereas, While the ACGME has taken steps to advocate for residents, its ability to effectively and timely work on their behalf is limited by “blunt tools” related to removal of accreditation and delay in providing feedback to programs; and

Whereas, Our AMA Residents and Fellows’ Bill of Rights (H-310.912) establishes that residents and fellows have rights to: (1) have a safe workspace that enables them to fulfill their clinical duties and educational obligations; (2) defend themselves against any allegations presented by a patient, health professional, or training program in accordance with due process guidelines established by the AMA; (3) be able to file a formal complaint with the ACGME to address program violations of residency training requirements without fear of recrimination and with the guarantee of due process; and (4) confidentially evaluate faculty and programs and expect that the training program will address deficiencies by these evaluations in a timely fashion; and

Whereas, Resident and fellow trainees still endure suboptimal training conditions, with recourse to address these issues limited by multiple factors including a high debt burden and fear of their program losing accreditation thus affecting future career prospects, which ultimately makes reporting even gross ACGME guideline infractions difficult to encourage; and

Whereas, During the COVID-19 pandemic, residents and fellow trainees have been particularly susceptible to poor conditions including limited availability of personal protective equipment (PPE), longer work hours, lack of hazard pay or similar programs, redeployment into other specialties which may or may not be relevant to education in their own specialty, and difficulty in securing workers’ compensation in the event of severe illness, with many programs revoking promised stipend increases; and

Whereas, The rate of closure of family medicine residency programs is increasing, and the Federation of State Medical Boards (FSMB) has records of over 50 hospitals with accredited training programs that have closed, with indications that more closures can be expected across the country in multiple specialties; and
Whereas, As exemplified by the Hahnemann University Hospital closure, residents and fellow trainees are vulnerable to the negative effects of hospital closures that threaten the quality and completion of their graduate medical education, financial wellbeing, and legal status within the United States.\textsuperscript{9,10} and

Whereas, Numerous organizations such as the ACGME, AMA, American Osteopathic Association (AOA), American Board of Medical Specialties (ABMS), Association of American Medical Colleges (AAMC), Council of Medical Specialty Societies, National Board of Medical Examiners (NBME), Pennsylvania Medical Society (PAMED), Philadelphia County Medical Society (PCMS), and Educational Commission for Foreign Medical Graduates (ECFMG) responded to the Hahnemann closure as well as other residency closures with offers of legal assistance, grants, visa assistance, tail-insurance coverage, and other forms of support\textsuperscript{11}; and

Whereas, The majority of funding for Graduate Medical Education (GME) is through Medicare and Medicaid, with additional funding through the U.S. Department of Veteran Affairs (VA) and Health Resources and Services Administration (HRSA), as well as private hospital funding\textsuperscript{12}; and

Whereas, The Centers for Medicare & Medicaid Services (CMS) is tasked with distributing the majority of GME funding, but is not responsible for overseeing the quality of training programs nor the wellness or treatment of trainees\textsuperscript{12}; and

Whereas, None of the organizations that responded to the Hahnemann residency closures were required to by law, nor was the response coordinated, regulated, or monitored by any type of oversight organization with regards to resident and fellow interests, and an ACGME investigation of the closure of the Hahnemann University Hospital found that no existing organizations represented resident and fellow interests to the exclusion of other stakeholder interests.\textsuperscript{3,11}; therefore be it

RESOLVED, That our American Medical Association work with relevant stakeholders to: (1) determine which organizations or governmental entities are best suited for being permanently responsible for resident and fellow interests without conflicts of interests; (2) determine how organizations can be held accountable for fulfilling their duties to protect the rights and wellbeing of resident and fellow trainees as detailed in the Residents and Fellows’ Bill of Rights; (3) determine methods of advocating for residents and fellows that are timely and effective without jeopardizing trainees’ current and future employability; (4) study and report back by the 2022 Annual Meeting on how such an organization may be created, in the event that no organizations or entities are identified that meet the above criteria; and (5) determine transparent methods to communicate available residency positions to displaced residents. (Directive to Take Action)

Fiscal Note: Modest - between $1,000 - $5,000

Received: 04/04/22
References:

RELEVANT AMA POLICY

Residents and Fellows’ Bill of Rights H-310.912

1. Our AMA continues to advocate for improvements in the ACGME Institutional and Common Program Requirements that support AMA policies as follows: a) adequate financial support for and guaranteed leave to attend professional meetings; b) submission of training verification information to requesting agencies within 30 days of the request; c) adequate compensation with consideration to local cost-of-living factors and years of training, and to include the orientation period; d) health insurance benefits to include dental and vision services; e) paid leave for all purposes (family, educational, vacation, sick) to be no less than six weeks per year; and f) stronger due process guidelines.

2. Our AMA encourages the ACGME to ensure access to educational programs and curricula as necessary to facilitate a deeper understanding by resident physicians of the US health care system and to increase their communication skills.

3. Our AMA regularly communicates to residency and fellowship programs and other GME stakeholders this Resident/Fellows Physicians’ Bill of Rights.

4. Our AMA: a) will promote residency and fellowship training programs to evaluate their own institution’s process for repayment and develop a leaner approach. This includes disbursement of funds by direct deposit as opposed to a paper check and an online system of applying for funds; b) encourages a system of expedited repayment for purchases of $200 or less (or an equivalent institutional threshold), for example through payment directly from their residency and fellowship programs (in contrast to following traditional workflow for reimbursement); and c) encourages training programs to develop a budget and strategy for planned expenses versus unplanned expenses, where planned expenses should be estimated using historical data, and should include trainee reimbursements for items such as educational materials, attendance at conferences, and entertaining applicants. Payment in advance or within one month of document submission is strongly recommended.

5. Our AMA will partner with ACGME and other relevant stakeholders to encourage training programs to reduce financial burdens on residents and fellows by providing employee benefits
including, but not limited to, on-call meal allowances, transportation support, relocation stipends, and childcare services.

6. Our AMA will work with the Accreditation Council for Graduate Medical Education (ACGME) and other relevant stakeholders to amend the ACGME Common Program Requirements to allow flexibility in the specialty-specific ACGME program requirements enabling specialties to require salary reimbursement or “protected time” for resident and fellow education by “core faculty,” program directors, and assistant/associate program directors.

7. Our AMA encourages teaching institutions to offer retirement plan options, retirement plan matching, financial advising and personal finance education.

8. Our AMA adopts the following “Residents and Fellows’ Bill of Rights” as applicable to all resident and fellow physicians in ACGME-accredited training programs:

**RESIDENT/FELLOW PHYSICIANS’ BILL OF RIGHTS**

Residents and fellows have a right to:

**A. An education that fosters professional development, takes priority over service, and leads to independent practice.**

With regard to education, residents and fellows should expect: (1) A graduate medical education experience that facilitates their professional and ethical development, to include regularly scheduled didactics for which they are released from clinical duties. Service obligations should not interfere with educational opportunities and clinical education should be given priority over service obligations; (2) Faculty who devote sufficient time to the educational program to fulfill their teaching and supervisory responsibilities; (3) Adequate clerical and clinical support services that minimize the extraneous, time-consuming work that draws attention from patient care issues and offers no educational value; (4) 24-hour per day access to information resources to educate themselves further about appropriate patient care; and (5) Resources that will allow them to pursue scholarly activities to include financial support and education leave to attend professional meetings.

**B. Appropriate supervision by qualified physician faculty with progressive resident responsibility toward independent practice.**

With regard to supervision, residents and fellows must be ultimately supervised by physicians who are adequately qualified and allow them to assume progressive responsibility appropriate to their level of education, competence, and experience. In instances where clinical education is provided by non-physicians, there must be an identified physician supervisor providing indirect supervision, along with mechanisms for reporting inappropriate, non-physician supervision to the training program, sponsoring institution or ACGME as appropriate.

**C. Regular and timely feedback and evaluation based on valid assessments of resident performance.**

With regard to evaluation and assessment processes, residents and fellows should expect: (1) Timely and substantive evaluations during each rotation in which their competence is objectively assessed by faculty who have directly supervised their work; (2) To evaluate the faculty and the program confidentially and in writing at least once annually and expect that the training program will address deficiencies revealed by these evaluations in a timely fashion; (3) Access to their training file and to be made aware of the contents of their file on an annual basis; and (4) Training programs to complete primary verification/credentialing forms and recredentialing forms, apply all required signatures to the forms, and then have the forms permanently secured in their educational files at the completion of training or a period of training and, when requested by any organization involved in credentialing process, ensure the submission of those documents to the requesting organization within thirty days of the request.

**D. A safe and supportive workplace with appropriate facilities.**

With regard to the workplace, residents and fellows should have access to: (1) A safe workplace that enables them to fulfill their clinical duties and educational obligations; (2) Secure, clean, and comfortable on-call rooms and parking facilities which are secure and well-lit; (3) Opportunities to participate on committees whose actions may affect their education, patient
care, workplace, or contract.

E. Adequate compensation and benefits that provide for resident well-being and health.
   (1) With regard to contracts, residents and fellows should receive: a. Information about the interviewing residency or fellowship program including a copy of the currently used contract clearly outlining the conditions for (re)appointment, details of remuneration, specific responsibilities including call obligations, and a detailed protocol for handling any grievance; and b. At least four months advance notice of contract non-renewal and the reason for non-renewal.
   (2) With regard to compensation, residents and fellows should receive: a. Compensation for time at orientation; and b. Salaries commensurate with their level of training and experience. Compensation should reflect cost of living differences based on local economic factors, such as housing, transportation, and energy costs (which affect the purchasing power of wages), and include appropriate adjustments for changes in the cost of living.
   (3) With regard to benefits, residents and fellows must be fully informed of and should receive: a. Quality and affordable comprehensive medical, mental health, dental, and vision care for residents and their families, as well as retirement plan options, professional liability insurance and disability insurance to all residents for disabilities resulting from activities that are part of the educational program; b. An institutional written policy on and education in the signs of excessive fatigue, clinical depression, substance abuse and dependence, and other physician impairment issues; c. Confidential access to mental health and substance abuse services; and d. A guaranteed, predetermined amount of paid vacation leave, sick leave, family and medical leave and educational/professional leave during each year in their training program, the total amount of which should not be less than six weeks; e. Leave in compliance with the Family and Medical Leave Act; and f. The conditions under which sleeping quarters, meals and laundry or their equivalent are to be provided.

F. Clinical and educational work hours that protect patient safety and facilitate resident well-being and education.
   With regard to clinical and educational work hours, residents and fellows should experience: (1) A reasonable work schedule that is in compliance with clinical and educational work hour requirements set forth by the ACGME; and (2) At-home call that is not so frequent or demanding such that rest periods are significantly diminished or that clinical and educational work hour requirements are effectively circumvented. Refer to AMA Policy H-310.907, “Resident/Fellow Clinical and Educational Work Hours,” for more information.

G. Due process in cases of allegations of misconduct or poor performance.
   With regard to the complaints and appeals process, residents and fellows should have the opportunity to defend themselves against any allegations presented against them by a patient, health professional, or training program in accordance with the due process guidelines established by the AMA.

H. Access to and protection by institutional and accreditation authorities when reporting violations.
   With regard to reporting violations to the ACGME, residents and fellows should: (1) Be informed by their program at the beginning of their training and again at each semi-annual review of the resources and processes available within the residency program for addressing resident concerns or complaints, including the program director, Residency Training Committee, and the designated institutional official; (2) Be able to file a formal complaint with the ACGME to address program violations of residency training requirements without fear of recrimination and with the guarantee of due process; and (3) Have the opportunity to address their concerns about the training program through confidential channels, including the ACGME concern process and/or the annual ACGME Resident Survey.

9. Our AMA will work with the ACGME and other relevant stakeholders to advocate for ways to defray additional costs related to residency and fellowship training, including essential amenities and/or high cost specialty-specific equipment required to perform clinical duties.
10. Our AMA believes that healthcare trainee salary, benefits, and overall compensation should, at minimum, reflect length of pre-training education, hours worked, and level of independence and complexity of care allowed by an individual’s training program (for example when comparing physicians in training and midlevel providers at equal postgraduate training levels).

11. The Residents and Fellows’ Bill of Rights will be prominently published online on the AMA website and disseminated to residency and fellowship programs.

12. Our AMA will distribute and promote the Residents and Fellows’ Bill of Rights online and individually to residency and fellowship training programs and encourage changes to institutional processes that embody these principles.