

## AMERICAN MEDICAL ASSOCIATION HOUSE OF DELEGATES

Resolution: 006  
(I-19)

Introduced by: Medical Student Section

Subject: Transparency Improving Informed Consent for Reproductive Health Services

Referred to: Reference Committee on Amendments to Constitution and Bylaws  
(\_\_\_\_\_, Chair)

---

1 Whereas, Federal regulations passed by Health and Human Services in 2018 and state laws  
2 allow organizations to refuse coverage and services for contraceptives and infertility care  
3 mandated in the Affordable Care Act<sup>1,2</sup>; and  
4

5 Whereas, Institutional obligations under those refusals impinge on a physician's ability to follow  
6 standard of care in consulting and providing reproductive health services<sup>3</sup>; and  
7

8 Whereas, American College of Obstetricians and Gynecology (ACOG) guidelines state that  
9 physicians are obligated to inform patients of their prior personal moral commitments and refer  
10 patients to other providers in cases of moral or religious objection for management, medication,  
11 or surgical evacuation<sup>4,5</sup>; and  
12

13 Whereas, The American Medical Association advocates for transparency when best practice  
14 medical care may conflict with a physician's or their institution's commitments;<sup>7</sup> which is not  
15 currently occurring according to a recent national survey of obstetricians and gynecologists  
16 showing that 35% of non-abortion providers would not provide a referral to a different institution  
17 for the service<sup>7</sup>; and  
18

19 Whereas, Reproductive healthcare access is vital to the health and well-being of both the  
20 mother and her child given that mis-timed pregnancies are associated with poor or delayed  
21 prenatal care, negative birth outcomes, Sexually Transmitted Infections (STIs) and cervical  
22 cancer of the mother<sup>8,9</sup>; and  
23

24 Whereas, Contraceptive care has applications beyond family planning: improving patient safety  
25 when given in conjunction with teratogenic medications, protecting women who have significant  
26 likelihood of mortality with pregnancy, or during teratogenic disease outbreaks like the 2016  
27 Zika Virus<sup>10, 11</sup>; and  
28

29 Whereas, Emergency contraception is widely utilized as 28.4% of women of reproductive age in  
30 the United States have used emergency contraceptives<sup>12</sup>; and  
31

32 Whereas, Public expenditures on family planning services save seven dollars on future  
33 expenditures for each dollar spent on these measures by reducing the incidence of preterm and  
34 low birth weight births, STIs, infertility, and cervical cancer<sup>13</sup>; and  
35

36 Whereas, Infertility services including In-Vitro Fertilization (IVF) and ova/sperm retrieval service  
37 availability varies significantly between states, insurance policies, and hospital systems<sup>14</sup>; and

Whereas, Studies have shown patients are “in dire need of positive rights to information about and services to avoid the potential gap in care” which non-transparent clinical policies present,<sup>9</sup> similar to the Medicare overhauls currently underway for price transparency<sup>15</sup>; therefore be it

RESOLVED, That our American Medical Association work with relevant stakeholders to establish a list of Essential Reproductive Health Services (Directive to Take Action), and be it further

RESOLVED, That our AMA advocate for legislation requiring healthcare organizations to clearly publish online and in points of service which Essential Reproductive Health Services are available at the organization along with any restrictions on Essential Reproductive Health Services at the institution, and include referral information to patients of other providers that cover the services within the same coverage area. (Directive to Take Action)

Fiscal Note:

Received: 08/28/19

#### References:

1. “Insurance Coverage of Contraceptives.” *Guttmacher Institute*, 2 Jan. 2019, [www.guttmacher.org/state-policy/explore/insurance-coverage-contraceptives?fbclid=IwAR3sA3yCGJ2o785GHd4SIL6WRj7ew-6eG68kNhlLeAOaBRdO\\_7Ukljhotg](http://www.guttmacher.org/state-policy/explore/insurance-coverage-contraceptives?fbclid=IwAR3sA3yCGJ2o785GHd4SIL6WRj7ew-6eG68kNhlLeAOaBRdO_7Ukljhotg).
2. U.S. Department of Health and Human Services. “Fact Sheet: Final Rules on Religious and Moral Exemptions and Accommodation for Coverage of Certain Preventive Services Under the Affordable Care Act.” *HHS.gov*, US Department of Health and Human Services, 7 Nov. 2018, [www.hhs.gov/about/news/2018/11/07/fact-sheet-final-rules-on-religious-and-moral-exemptions-and-accommodation-for-coverage-of-certain-preventive-services-under-affordable-care-act.html?fbclid=IwAR369PitAJh4RZDf25xoxmWM-eWG-dwAS9uqxu4LQMniAFipv7KuYPmWXEc](http://www.hhs.gov/about/news/2018/11/07/fact-sheet-final-rules-on-religious-and-moral-exemptions-and-accommodation-for-coverage-of-certain-preventive-services-under-affordable-care-act.html?fbclid=IwAR369PitAJh4RZDf25xoxmWM-eWG-dwAS9uqxu4LQMniAFipv7KuYPmWXEc).
3. Gordon, Mara. “For Doctors Who Want To Provide Abortions, Employment Contracts Often Tie Their Hands.” *NPR*, NPR, 26 Nov. 2018, [www.npr.org/sections/health-shots/2018/11/26/668347657/for-doctors-who-want-to-provide-abortion-employment-contracts-often-tie-their-h](http://www.npr.org/sections/health-shots/2018/11/26/668347657/for-doctors-who-want-to-provide-abortion-employment-contracts-often-tie-their-h).
4. “Women’s Health Care Physicians.” *Group B Strep and Pregnancy - ACOG*, [www.acog.org/Clinical-Guidance-and-Publications/Committee-Opinions/Committee-on-Ethics/The-Limits-of-Conscientious-Refusal-in-Reproductive-Medicine](http://www.acog.org/Clinical-Guidance-and-Publications/Committee-Opinions/Committee-on-Ethics/The-Limits-of-Conscientious-Refusal-in-Reproductive-Medicine).
5. Early pregnancy loss. *ACOG Practice bulletin no. 150. Obstet Gynecol* 2015; 125: pp. 1258-1267
6. Morris, Jane, and Kavita Shah Arora. “Should Clinicians Challenge Faith-Based Institutional Values Conflicting with Their Own?” *Journal of Ethics | American Medical Association, American Medical Association*, 1 July 2018, [journalofethics.ama-assn.org/article/should-clinicians-challenge-faith-based-institutional-values-conflicting-their-own/2018-07](http://journalofethics.ama-assn.org/article/should-clinicians-challenge-faith-based-institutional-values-conflicting-their-own/2018-07).
7. Estimating abortion provision and abortion referrals among United States Obstetrician-gynecologists in private practice. Desai, Sheila et al. *Contraception*, Volume 97, Issue 4, 297 - 302
8. Kost, Kathryn, et al. “Pregnancy Intentions, Maternal Behaviors, and Infant Health: Investigating Relationships With New Measures and Propensity Score Analysis” *Demography*. 2015;52(1):83-11. doi:10.1007/s13524-014-0359-9
9. Frost, J J, et al. “Return on Investment: a Fuller Assessment of the Benefits and Cost Savings of the US Publicly Funded Family Planning Program.” *Current Neurology and Neuroscience Reports.*, U.S. National Library of Medicine, Dec. 2014, [www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/25314928](http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/pubmed/25314928).
10. Andreoli L, Bertsias G, Agmon-Levin N, Brown S, Cervera R, Costedoat-Chalumeau N, et al. EULAR recommendations for women’s health and the management of family planning, assisted reproduction, pregnancy and menopause in patients with systemic lupus erythematosus and/or antiphospholipid syndrome. *Annals of the Rheumatic Diseases*. 2017; 76:476-85.
11. Lathrop E, Romero L, Hurst S, Bracero N, Zapata LB, Frey MT, et al. The Zika Contraception Access Network: a feasibility programme to increase access to contraception in Puerto Rico during the 2016–17 Zika virus outbreak. *The Lancet Public Health*. 2018; 3:e91-e9.
12. Heller, Caroline, et al. “Emergency Contraception Use: The Influence of Awareness, Attitudes, and Beliefs Among Non-Hispanic White, Non-Hispanic Black, and Hispanic Women in the United States.” *Women’s Health Issues*, vol. 29, no. 2, 2019, pp. 161–169., doi:10.1016/j.whi.2019.01.003.
13. “You Have the Right to Know the Price.” *CMS.gov Centers for Medicare & Medicaid Services*, CMS, 27 Nov. 2018, [www.cms.gov/blog/you-have-right-know-price](http://www.cms.gov/blog/you-have-right-know-price).
14. Thompson, Charis. “IVF Global Histories, USA: between Rock and a Marketplace.” *Reproductive Biomedicine & Society Online*, vol. 2, 2016, pp. 128–135., doi:10.1016/j.rbms.2016.09.003.
15. “Learning from Experience: Where Religious Liberty Meets Reproductive Rights.” *Guttmacher Institute*, 18 Sept. 2018, [www.guttmacher.org/gpr/2016/learning-experience-where-religious-liberty-meets-reproductive-rights](http://www.guttmacher.org/gpr/2016/learning-experience-where-religious-liberty-meets-reproductive-rights).

#### RELEVANT AMA POLICY

##### Truth and Transparency in Pregnancy Counseling Centers H-420.954

1. Our AMA supports that any entity offering crisis pregnancy services disclose information on site, in its advertising, and before any services are provided concerning the medical services, contraception, termination of pregnancy or referral for such services, adoption options or referral for such services that it provides; and be it further

2. Our AMA advocates that any entity providing medical or health services to pregnant women that markets medical or any clinical services abide by licensing requirements and have the appropriate qualified licensed personnel to do so and abide by federal health information privacy laws.

Citation: (Res. 7, I-11)

#### **Access to Emergency Contraception D-75.997**

1. Our AMA will: (a) intensify efforts to improve awareness and understanding about the availability of emergency contraception in the general public; and (b) support and monitor the application process of manufacturers filing for over-the-counter approval of emergency contraception pills with the Food and Drug Administration (FDA).

2. Our AMA: (a) will work in collaboration with other stakeholders (such as American College of Obstetricians and Gynecologists, American Academy of Pediatrics, and American College of Preventive Medicine) to communicate with the National Association of Chain Drug Stores and the National Community Pharmacists Association, and request that pharmacies utilize their web site or other means to signify whether they stock and dispense emergency contraception, and if not, where it can be obtained in their region, either with or without a prescription; and (b) urges that established emergency contraception regimens be approved for over-the-counter access to women of reproductive age, as recommended by the relevant medical specialty societies and the US Food and Drug Administration's own expert panel.

#### **Reducing Unintended Pregnancy H-75.987**

Our AMA: (1) urges health care professionals to provide care for women of reproductive age, to assist them in planning for pregnancy and support age-appropriate education in esteem building, decision-making and family life in an effort to introduce the concept of planning for childbearing in the educational process; (2) supports reducing unintended pregnancies as a national goal; and (3) supports the training of all primary care physicians and relevant allied health professionals in the area of preconception counseling, including the recognition of long-acting reversible contraceptives as efficacious and economical forms of contraception.

Citation: CMS Rep. 1, A-00; Appended: Res. 506, A-07; Reaffirmed: CMS Rep. 01, A-17;

#### **AMA Principles for Physician Employment H-225.950**

##### **1. Addressing Conflicts of Interest**

a) A physician's paramount responsibility is to his or her patients. Additionally, given that an employed physician occupies a position of significant trust, he or she owes a duty of loyalty to his or her employer. This divided loyalty can create conflicts of interest, such as financial incentives to over- or under-treat patients, which employed physicians should strive to recognize and address.

b) Employed physicians should be free to exercise their personal and professional judgement in voting, speaking and advocating on any manner regarding patient care interests, the profession, health care in the community, and the independent exercise of medical judgment. Employed physicians should not be deemed in breach of their employment agreements, nor be retaliated against by their employers, for asserting these interests. Employed physicians also should enjoy academic freedom to pursue clinical research and other academic pursuits within the ethical principles of the medical profession and the guidelines of the organization.

c) In any situation where the economic or other interests of the employer are in conflict with patient welfare, patient welfare must take priority.

d) Physicians should always make treatment and referral decisions based on the best interests of their patients. Employers and the physicians they employ must assure that agreements or understandings (explicit or implicit) restricting, discouraging, or encouraging particular treatment or referral options are disclosed to patients.

(i) No physician should be required or coerced to perform or assist in any non-emergent procedure that would be contrary to his/her religious beliefs or moral convictions; and

(ii) No physician should be discriminated against in employment, promotion, or the extension of staff or other privileges because he/she either performed or assisted in a lawful, non-emergent procedure, or refused to do so on the grounds that it violates his/her religious beliefs or moral convictions.

e) Assuming a title or position that may remove a physician from direct patient-physician relationships--such as medical director, vice president for medical affairs, etc.--does not override professional ethical obligations. Physicians whose actions serve to override the individual patient care decisions of other physicians are themselves engaged in the practice of medicine and are subject to professional ethical obligations and may be legally responsible for such decisions. Physicians who hold administrative leadership positions should use whatever administrative and governance mechanisms exist within the organization to foster policies that enhance the quality of patient care and the patient care experience.

Refer to the AMA Code of Medical Ethics for further guidance on conflicts of interest.

##### **2. Advocacy for Patients and the Profession**

a) Patient advocacy is a fundamental element of the patient-physician relationship that should not be altered by the health care system or setting in which physicians practice, or the methods by which they are compensated.

b) Employed physicians should be free to engage in volunteer work outside of, and which does not interfere with, their duties as employees.

### 3. Contracting

a) Physicians should be free to enter into mutually satisfactory contractual arrangements, including employment, with hospitals, health care systems, medical groups, insurance plans, and other entities as permitted by law and in accordance with the ethical principles of the medical profession.

b) Physicians should never be coerced into employment with hospitals, health care systems, medical groups, insurance plans, or any other entities. Employment agreements between physicians and their employers should be negotiated in good faith. Both parties are urged to obtain the advice of legal counsel experienced in physician employment matters when negotiating employment contracts.

c) When a physician's compensation is related to the revenue he or she generates, or to similar factors, the employer should make clear to the physician the factors upon which compensation is based.

d) Termination of an employment or contractual relationship between a physician and an entity employing that physician does not necessarily end the patient-physician relationship between the employed physician and persons under his/her care. When a physician's employment status is unilaterally terminated by an employer, the physician and his or her employer should notify the physician's patients that the physician will no longer be working with the employer and should provide them with the physician's new contact information. Patients should be given the choice to continue to be seen by the physician in his or her new practice setting or to be treated by another physician still working with the employer. Records for the physician's patients should be retained for as long as they are necessary for the care of the patients or for addressing legal issues faced by the physician; records should not be destroyed without notice to the former employee. Where physician possession of all medical records of his or her patients is not already required by state law, the employment agreement should specify that the physician is entitled to copies of patient charts and records upon a specific request in writing from any patient, or when such records are necessary for the physician's defense in malpractice actions, administrative investigations, or other proceedings against the physician.

(e) Physician employment agreements should contain provisions to protect a physician's right to due process before termination for cause. When such cause relates to quality, patient safety, or any other matter that could trigger the initiation of disciplinary action by the medical staff, the physician should be afforded full due process under the medical staff bylaws, and the agreement should not be terminated before the governing body has acted on the recommendation of the medical staff. Physician employment agreements should specify whether or not termination of employment is grounds for automatic termination of hospital medical staff membership or clinical privileges. When such cause is non-clinical or not otherwise a concern of the medical staff, the physician should be afforded whatever due process is outlined in the employer's human resources policies and procedures.

(f) Physicians are encouraged to carefully consider the potential benefits and harms of entering into employment agreements containing without cause termination provisions. Employers should never terminate agreements without cause when the underlying reason for the termination relates to quality, patient safety, or any other matter that could trigger the initiation of disciplinary action by the medical staff.

(g) Physicians are discouraged from entering into agreements that restrict the physician's right to practice medicine for a specified period of time or in a specified area upon termination of employment.

(h) Physician employment agreements should contain dispute resolution provisions. If the parties desire an alternative to going to court, such as arbitration, the contract should specify the manner in which disputes will be resolved.

Refer to the AMA Annotated Model Physician-Hospital Employment Agreement and the AMA Annotated Model Physician-Group Practice Employment Agreement for further guidance on physician employment contracts.

### 4. Hospital Medical Staff Relations

a) Employed physicians should be members of the organized medical staffs of the hospitals or health systems with which they have contractual or financial arrangements, should be subject to the bylaws of those medical staffs, and should conduct their professional activities according to the bylaws, standards, rules, and regulations and policies adopted by those medical staffs.

b) Regardless of the employment status of its individual members, the organized medical staff remains responsible for the provision of quality care and must work collectively to improve patient care and outcomes.

c) Employed physicians who are members of the organized medical staff should be free to exercise their personal and professional judgment in voting, speaking, and advocating on any matter regarding medical staff matters and should not be deemed in breach of their employment agreements, nor be retaliated against by their employers, for asserting these interests.

d) Employers should seek the input of the medical staff prior to the initiation, renewal, or termination of exclusive employment contracts.



Refer to the AMA Conflict of Interest Guidelines for the Organized Medical Staff for further guidance on the relationship between employed physicians and the medical staff organization.

#### 5. Peer Review and Performance Evaluations

- a) All physicians should promote and be subject to an effective program of peer review to monitor and evaluate the quality, appropriateness, medical necessity, and efficiency of the patient care services provided within their practice settings.
- b) Peer review should follow established procedures that are identical for all physicians practicing within a given health care organization, regardless of their employment status.
- c) Peer review of employed physicians should be conducted independently of and without interference from any human resources activities of the employer. Physicians--not lay administrators--should be ultimately responsible for all peer review of medical services provided by employed physicians.
- d) Employed physicians should be accorded due process protections, including a fair and objective hearing, in all peer review proceedings. The fundamental aspects of a fair hearing are a listing of specific charges, adequate notice of the right to a hearing, the opportunity to be present and to rebut evidence, and the opportunity to present a defense. Due process protections should extend to any disciplinary action sought by the employer that relates to the employed physician's independent exercise of medical judgment.
- e) Employers should provide employed physicians with regular performance evaluations, which should be presented in writing and accompanied by an oral discussion with the employed physician. Physicians should be informed before the beginning of the evaluation period of the general criteria to be considered in their performance evaluations, for example: quality of medical services provided, nature and frequency of patient complaints, employee productivity, employee contribution to the administrative/operational activities of the employer, etc.
- (f) Upon termination of employment with or without cause, an employed physician generally should not be required to resign his or her hospital medical staff membership or any of the clinical privileges held during the term of employment, unless an independent action of the medical staff calls for such action, and the physician has been afforded full due process under the medical staff bylaws. Automatic rescission of medical staff membership and/or clinical privileges following termination of an employment agreement is tolerable only if each of the following conditions is met:
  - i. The agreement is for the provision of services on an exclusive basis; and
  - ii. Prior to the termination of the exclusive contract, the medical staff holds a hearing, as defined by the medical staff and hospital, to permit interested parties to express their views on the matter, with the medical staff subsequently making a recommendation to the governing body as to whether the contract should be terminated, as outlined in AMA Policy H-225.985; and
  - iii. The agreement explicitly states that medical staff membership and/or clinical privileges must be resigned upon termination of the agreement.

Refer to the AMA Principles for Incident-Based Peer Review and Disciplining at Health Care Organizations (AMA Policy H-375.965) for further guidance on peer review.

#### 6. Payment Agreements

- a) Although they typically assign their billing privileges to their employers, employed physicians or their chosen representatives should be prospectively involved if the employer negotiates agreements for them for professional fees, capitation or global billing, or shared savings. Additionally, employed physicians should be informed about the actual payment amount allocated to the professional fee component of the total payment received by the contractual arrangement.
- b) Employed physicians have a responsibility to assure that bills issued for services they provide are accurate and should therefore retain the right to review billing claims as may be necessary to verify that such bills are correct. Employers should indemnify and defend, and save harmless, employed physicians with respect to any violation of law or regulation or breach of contract in connection with the employer's billing for physician services, which violation is not the fault of the employee.

Citation: BOT Rep. 6, I-12; Reaffirmed: CMS Rep. 6, I-13; Modified in lieu of Res. 2, I-13; Modified: Res. 737, A-14; Reaffirmed: BOT Rep. 21, A-16; Reaffirmed: CMS Rep. 05, A-17; Reaffirmed: CMS Rep. 07, A-19; Reaffirmed: CMS Rep. 11, A-19; Modified: BOT Rep. 13, A-19

#### **Increasing Availability and Coverage for Immediate Postpartum Long-Acting Reversible Contraceptive Placement H-75.984**

1. Our AMA: (a) recognizes the practice of immediate postpartum and post pregnancy long-acting reversible contraception placement to be a safe and cost effective way of reducing future unintended pregnancies; and (b) supports the coverage by Medicaid, Medicare, and private insurers for immediate postpartum long-acting reversible contraception devices and placement, and that these be billed separately from the obstetrical global fee.

2. Our AMA encourages relevant specialty organizations to provide training for physicians regarding (a) patients who are eligible for immediate postpartum long-acting reversible contraception, and (b) immediate postpartum long-acting reversible contraception placement protocols and procedures.

Citation: Res. 101, A-16

#### **Abortion H-5.995**

Our AMA reaffirms that: (1) abortion is a medical procedure and should be performed only by a duly licensed physician and surgeon in conformance with standards of good medical practice and the Medical Practice Act of his state; and (2) no physician or other professional personnel shall be required to perform an act violative of good medical judgment. Neither physician, hospital, nor hospital personnel shall be required to perform any act violative of personally held moral principles. In these circumstances, good medical practice requires only that the physician or other professional withdraw from the case, so long as the withdrawal is consistent with good medical practice.

Citation: (Sub. Res. 43, A-73; Reaffirmed: I-86; Reaffirmed: Sunset Report, I-96; Reaffirmed by Sub. Res. 208, I-96; Reaffirmed by BOT Rep. 26, A-97; Reaffirmed: CMS Rep. 1, I-00; Reaffirmed: CEJA Rep. 6, A-10)

#### **Policy on Abortion H-5.990**

The issue of support of or opposition to abortion is a matter for members of the AMA to decide individually, based on personal values or beliefs. The AMA will take no action which may be construed as an attempt to alter or influence the personal views of individual physicians regarding abortion procedures.

Citation: Res. 158, A-90; Reaffirmed by Sub. Res. 208, I-96; Reaffirmed by BOT Rep. 26, A-97; Reaffirmed: CSAPH Rep. 3, A-07; Reaffirmed: Res. 1, A-09; Reaffirmed: CEJA Rep. 03, A-19

#### **Increasing Transparency of Hospital Contracts for Clinical and Non-Clinical Services H-215.963**

1. Our AMA encourage hospitals to publicly disclose the following parameters of their contracts for the delivery of clinical and non-clinical services:

- (a) The entity with which the hospital has contracted;
- (b) The ownership of the entity with which the hospital has contracted;
- (c) What services are being provided in accordance with the contract;
- (d) Which entity owners, if any, serve on any of the hospital's boards or its affiliates' boards; and
- (e) Whether the hospital requires exclusive physician referrals to hospital subsidiaries for services.

2. AMA policy is that the organized medical staffs have an opportunity to be involved in the selection of clinical and non-clinical service providers in hospitals with adherence to appropriate conflict of interest policies.

Citation: BOT Rep. 2, A-09; Reaffirmed: CMS Rep. 01, A-19

#### **Price Transparency D-155.987**

1. Our AMA encourages physicians to communicate information about the cost of their professional services to individual patients, taking into consideration the insurance status (e.g., self-pay, in-network insured, out-of-network insured) of the patient or other relevant information where possible.

2. Our AMA advocates that health plans provide plan enrollees or their designees with complete information regarding plan benefits and real time cost-sharing information associated with both in-network and out-of-network provider services or other plan designs that may affect patient out-of-pocket costs.

3. Our AMA will actively engage with health plans, public and private entities, and other stakeholder groups in their efforts to facilitate price and quality transparency for patients and physicians, and help ensure that entities promoting price transparency tools have processes in place to ensure the accuracy and relevance of the information they provide.

4. Our AMA will work with states to support and strengthen the development of all-payer claims databases.

5. Our AMA encourages electronic health records vendors to include features that assist in facilitating price transparency for physicians and patients.

6. Our AMA encourages efforts to educate patients in health economics literacy, including the development of resources that help patients understand the complexities of health care pricing and encourage them to seek information regarding the cost of health care services they receive or anticipate receiving.

7. Our AMA will request that the Centers for Medicare and Medicaid Services expand its Medicare Physician Fee Schedule Look-up Tool to include hospital outpatient payments. Citation: CMS Rep. 4, A-15; Reaffirmed in lieu of: Res. 121, A-16; Reaffirmed in lieu of: Res. 213, I-17; Reaffirmed: BOT Rep. 14, A-18; Reaffirmed in lieu of: Res. 112, A-19