

REPORT 5 OF THE COUNCIL ON SCIENCE AND PUBLIC HEALTH (A-18)
Tobacco Harm Reduction: A Comprehensive Nicotine Policy to Reduce Death and Disease Caused
by Smoking (Resolution 403-A-17)
(Reference Committee D)

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Objective: This report examines the available evidence regarding harm reduction approaches to reducing tobacco-related mortality, with a focus on electronic cigarettes.

Methods: English language reports were selected from searches of the PubMed, Google Scholar, and Cochrane Library databases from March 2014 to January 2018 using the search terms “tobacco” and “harm reduction,” “nicotine,” “electronic cigarette,” “e-cigarette,” “ENDS,” “noncombustible tobacco product,” “smokeless tobacco,” and “tobacco cessation.” Additional articles were identified by manual review of the reference lists of pertinent publications. Recognizing the dynamic nature of the research being published on this topic, the Council deemed it appropriate to summarize the findings and conclusions of the recent National Academies of Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine (National Academies) report on the “Public Health Consequences of E-Cigarettes” related to harm reduction. Articles published subsequent to the National Academies report are cited, as appropriate.

Results: Despite reductions in combustible tobacco use, it still represents the leading cause of preventable death in the United States. A growing number of non-combustible tobacco products are thought to be less hazardous than combustibles, but limited evidence is available on their long-term health risks. E-cigarettes are among the most widely used non-combustible tobacco product. Available evidence suggests that those who completely substitute e-cigarettes for combustible tobacco cigarettes have reduced exposure to numerous toxicants and carcinogens present in combustible tobacco cigarettes. However, the efficacy of e-cigarettes in reducing health risks has not been adequately evaluated in well-designed epidemiological studies and RCTs. Benefits are not realized in dual users, who in fact may be exposed to additional adverse health effects.

Conclusion: Currently available evidence from short-term studies points to electronic cigarettes as containing fewer toxicants than combustible cigarettes, but the use of electronic cigarettes is not harmless. Significant concerns exist that novel, non-combustible products may pose a significant threat to tobacco cessation and prevention efforts. Smokers concerned about their health who see the claims for novel tobacco products may think that a safer cigarette genuinely exists, making them less inclined to try to quit smoking. Likewise, those who never used tobacco products may initiate tobacco use assuming that a safe tobacco product exists. E-cigarette use among youth and young adults is a public health concern. Available data suggest that youth who use e-cigarettes are more likely to smoke combustible cigarettes. AMA policy should recognize that the use of products containing nicotine in any form among youth, including e-cigarettes, is unsafe and can cause addiction. Evidence-based methods for tobacco cessation exist. More needs to be done to promote evidence-based cessation methods to those who are trying to quit smoking.

REPORT OF THE COUNCIL ON SCIENCE AND PUBLIC HEALTH

CSAPH Report 5-A-18

Subject: Tobacco Harm Reduction: A Comprehensive Nicotine Policy to Reduce Death and Disease Caused by Smoking (Resolution 403-A-17)

Presented by: Robert A. Gilchick, MD, MPH, Chair

Referred to: Reference Committee D
(Shannon Kilgore, MD, Chair)

1 INTRODUCTION

2
3 Resolution 403-A-17, “Tobacco Harm Reduction: A Comprehensive Nicotine Policy to Reduce
4 Death and Disease Caused by Smoking,” introduced by the Resident and Fellow Section and
5 referred by the House of Delegates, asks:

6
7 That our American Medical Association (AMA) advocate for tobacco harm
8 reduction approaches to be added to existing tobacco treatment and control efforts
9 (New HOD Policy);

10
11 That our AMA educate physicians and patients on the myriad health effects of
12 different nicotine products and emphasize the critical role of smoke and combustion
13 in causing disease (Directive to Take Action);

14
15 That our AMA encourage physicians to adopt patient-specific, individualized
16 approaches to smoking cessation, particularly for patients with disease secondary to
17 smoking and for patients who have otherwise failed traditional methods for
18 smoking cessation (New HOD Policy);

19
20 That our AMA continue its focus on research to identify and expand options that
21 may assist patients to transition away from smoking, including nicotine replacement
22 therapies and noncombustible nicotine products (including e-cigarettes) (Directive
23 to Take Action);

24
25 That the AMA reaffirm its position on strong enforcement of US Food and Drug
26 Administration and other agency regulations for the prevention of use of all
27 electronic nicotine delivery systems and tobacco products by anyone under the legal
28 minimum purchase age. This shall include marketing to children, direct use or
29 purchasing by children and indirect diversion to children. Further, that our AMA
30 reaffirm physician education of patients to limit these products for children in any
31 and all capacity. (Reaffirm HOD Policy)

© 2018 American Medical Association. All rights reserved.

Action of the AMA House of Delegates 2018 Annual Meeting: CSAPH Report 5
Recommendations Adopted as Amended, and Remainder of Report Filed.

1 The Council on Science and Public Health (Council) has issued two previous reports on
2 electronic cigarettes, in 2010 and 2014, which helped establish our AMA's existing
3 policy around non-combustible tobacco products.

4 5 METHODS

6
7 English language reports were selected from searches of the PubMed, Google Scholar, and
8 Cochrane Library databases from March 2014 to January 2018 using the search terms "tobacco"
9 and "harm reduction," "nicotine," "electronic cigarette," "e-cigarette," "ENDS," "noncombustible
10 tobacco product," "smokeless tobacco," and "tobacco cessation." Additional articles were
11 identified by manual review of the reference lists of pertinent publications. Websites managed by
12 federal and state agencies and applicable regulatory and advocacy organizations also were
13 reviewed for relevant information.

14
15 Recognizing the dynamic nature of the research being published on this topic, the Council deemed
16 it appropriate to summarize the findings and conclusions of the recent National Academies of
17 Sciences, Engineering, and Medicine (National Academies) report on the "Public Health
18 Consequences of E-Cigarettes" related to harm reduction. Articles published subsequent to the
19 National Academies report are cited, as appropriate, in this report.

20 21 CURRENT AMA POLICY

22
23 It is the AMA's position that all tobacco products are harmful to health, and that there is no such
24 thing as a safe cigarette. AMA policy urges Congress to pass legislation to phase in the production
25 of less hazardous and less toxic tobacco, and to authorize the FDA to have broad-based powers to
26 regulate tobacco products. AMA policy also encourages the FDA and other appropriate agencies to
27 conduct or fund research on how tobacco products might be modified to facilitate cessation of use,
28 including the elimination of nicotine and elimination of additives that enhance addictiveness.

29
30 AMA policy encourages physicians to use evidence-based clinical practice guidelines on smoking
31 cessation for the treatment of patients with nicotine dependence and urges physicians to promote
32 the use of FDA-approved smoking cessation tools and resources for their patients and caregivers.
33 Physicians should be prepared to counsel patients about the use of electronic nicotine delivery
34 systems (ENDS), including electronic cigarettes (e-cigarettes), the potential for nicotine addiction,
35 and the hazards of dual use of e-cigarettes with conventional cigarettes. Our AMA also encourages
36 further clinical and epidemiological research on e-cigarettes as well as research and evaluation on
37 promising smoking cessation protocols that promote abrupt cessation of smoking without reliance
38 on pharmaceutical products.

39 40 HISTORY OF TOBACCO HARM REDUCTION

41
42 Tobacco products in any form are harmful and addictive and can cause disease and death.¹
43 Combustible cigarettes cause the majority of tobacco-related disease and are responsible for more
44 than 480,000 deaths in the United States each year, and for millions more living with smoking-
45 related diseases.^{1,2} When used as intended, combustible cigarettes are addictive by design and are
46 directly responsible for the deaths of at least half of all long-term users.³

47
48 Over the last decade, a new generation of tobacco products has entered the marketplace promising
49 reduced exposure to toxicants in tobacco smoke and claiming to reduce the risk of cancer or other
50 diseases.⁴ This has resulted in a renewed discussion around harm reduction policies, which aim to
51 reduce, but not eliminate tobacco-related health risks.⁵

1 Public health advocates have been hesitant to support harm reduction approaches for tobacco
2 because of a lack of trust in tobacco companies and their ability or willingness to develop products
3 that will actually reduce risks.⁶ Several times in the last 50 years, the tobacco industry has
4 developed a new cigarette, which it has promoted as safer. Large proportions of the smoking
5 population switched to these products, mistakenly believing they were reducing their health risk,
6 only to realize these were false promises.⁷ Specifically, experience with products promoted by the
7 tobacco industry as safer in the past, such as “light” cigarettes, resulted in increased toxicant
8 exposures with smokers compensating for reduced nicotine by smoking with greater frequency and
9 intensity.⁶

10
11 In 2001, the Institute of Medicine (IOM, now the National Academies) assessed the science base
12 for tobacco harm reduction. The IOM committee concluded that for many diseases attributable to
13 tobacco use, reducing the risk of disease by reducing exposure to tobacco toxicants is feasible.⁸
14 However, such products have not been evaluated adequately to conclude they are in fact associated
15 with reduced risks.⁸ Furthermore, according to the IOM, “the regulation of all tobacco products is a
16 necessary precondition for assuring a scientific basis for determining the effects of potentially
17 reduced-exposure products and assuring the public has current, reliable information on the risks
18 and benefits.”⁸ Finally, the public health impact of potential reduced-exposure products is unknown
19 because their effect on public health will depend on their biological harm and individual and
20 community behaviors around their use.⁸

21
22 In 2005, with funding from the American Legacy Foundation and the Robert Wood Johnson
23 Foundation, the Strategic Dialogue on Tobacco Harm Reduction (Dialogue) was formed to address
24 critically important aspects of the harm reduction debate including research priorities, overarching
25 strategic considerations, policy recommendations, and communication methods.⁴ Members of the
26 Dialogue agreed on the concept of the continuum of risk, which is determined by the delivery of
27 toxicants and nicotine.^{4,9} Nicotine replacement therapy (NRT) (i.e., “gum,” patch, and lozenge) is
28 on the safer end, with combustible cigarettes on the more hazardous end, of the spectrum.⁴ When
29 users of combustible cigarettes switch to smokeless tobacco products, “maximal potential reduction
30 in harm could only occur with products that result in the lowest exposure to toxicants, are subject
31 to government regulation, and that avoid adverse consequences such as increased initiation of
32 tobacco use or decreased cessation.”⁴

33 34 THE CONTINUUM OF RISK

35
36 There is a spectrum of tobacco and medicinal products that are designed to deliver nicotine to the
37 user.¹⁰ The toxicity associated with these products varies.¹⁰

38 39 *FDA Approved Products for Treatment of Tobacco Use Disorder*

40
41 FDA has approved several smoking cessation products designed to help users gradually withdraw
42 from smoking by using specific amounts of nicotine that decrease over time. NRT products are safe
43 and effective medications to help people stop smoking.¹¹ While NRT products contain nicotine in
44 controlled amounts, they do not contain the other harmful chemicals found in tobacco products.
45 NRT products are available over the counter and by prescription. Over-the-counter NRTs are
46 approved for sale to people age 18 and older. They are available under various brand names
47 (sometimes as generic products) and include transdermal nicotine patches, nicotine gum, and
48 nicotine lozenges.¹¹ Prescription NRT is available under the brand name Nicotrol, and is available
49 both as a nasal spray and an oral inhaler.¹¹ The FDA has approved two pharmacotherapy products
50 for tobacco use disorder that do not contain nicotine. They are Chantix® (varenicline tartrate) and
51 Zyban® (bupropion hydrochloride).¹¹ Both are available in tablet form and by prescription only.

1 *Modified Risk Tobacco Product (MRTP)*

2

3 MRTPs are tobacco products that are sold or distributed for use to reduce harm or the risk of
4 tobacco-related disease associated with commercially marketed tobacco products.¹² FDA can issue
5 an order authorizing the marketing of a MRTP if the evidence demonstrates that the product will or
6 is expected to benefit the health of the population.¹²

7

8 The FDA has not approved any MRTPs. Applications from R.J. Reynolds Tobacco Company for
9 their Camel Snus smokeless tobacco product and Philip Morris Products for their IQOS system
10 with Marlboro Heatsticks (a heat not burn tobacco device) are currently under scientific review.¹²
11 In January 2018, the FDA's Tobacco Products Scientific Advisory Committee (TPSAC) voted 8-0
12 with one abstention against Philip Morris' claim that the IQOS system can reduce the risks of
13 tobacco-related diseases.¹³ In considering whether switching completely to IQOS presents less risk
14 of harm than continuing to smoke cigarettes, the committee voted narrowly against the claim.¹³
15 TPSAC's recommendations and votes are not binding on the FDA.

16

17 *Non-Combustible Tobacco Products*

18

19 A number of non-combustible tobacco products are promoted as less harmful than combustible
20 cigarettes. However, limited data are available on the long-term health effects of these products. E-
21 cigarettes are among the most popular of these products. In 2014, more than 460 brands of e-
22 cigarettes, available in >7,700 unique flavors, were being sold on the internet.¹⁴ E-cigarette liquids
23 can expose users to toxicants, including solvents (propylene glycol and glycerol), flavorings, and
24 other additives. Furthermore, heating and aerosolizing e-liquids can generate additional harmful
25 substances.⁵ The FDA currently regulates smokeless tobacco and some dissolvable tobacco
26 products. The agency has finalized a rule extending its regulatory authority to all tobacco products,
27 including e-cigarettes, cigars, hookah, and pipe tobacco, but recently extended the deadline for
28 agency review.

29

30 *Combustible Cigarettes*

31

32 There are approximately 600 known ingredients in combustible cigarettes.¹⁵ When burned, more
33 than 7,000 additional chemicals are created, at least 69 of which are known to cause cancer, and
34 many others are poisonous.¹⁵ Smoking leads to disease and disability and harms nearly every organ
35 of the body. For every person who dies because of smoking, at least 30 people live with a serious
36 smoking-related illness.¹⁶ Smoking causes cancer, heart disease, stroke, lung diseases, diabetes, and
37 chronic obstructive pulmonary disease, including emphysema and chronic bronchitis.¹⁶
38 Secondhand smoke exposure contributes to approximately 41,000 deaths among non-smoking
39 adults and 400 infant deaths annually.¹⁶ Secondhand smoke causes stroke, lung cancer, and
40 coronary heart disease in adults.¹⁶ Infants and children who are exposed to secondhand smoke are
41 at increased risk for sudden infant death syndrome, acute respiratory infections, middle ear disease,
42 more severe asthma, respiratory symptoms, and slowed lung growth.¹⁶

43

44 **FDA PLAN FOR TOBACCO AND NICOTINE REGULATION**

45

46 In 2017, the FDA announced plans to reduce the devastating toll of tobacco use. The plan involves
47 two primary parts: (1) reducing the addictiveness of combustible cigarettes and (2) recognizing and
48 clarifying the role that potentially less harmful tobacco products could play in improving public

1 health.² The FDA also has acknowledged the need for medicinal nicotine and other therapeutic
2 products to play a greater role in helping smokers to quit and remain nonsmokers.²
3

4 The Family Smoking Prevention and Tobacco Control Act of 2009 gave the FDA the authority to
5 establish tobacco product standards that are appropriate for the protection of the public's health.¹⁷
6 Standards may require the reduction or elimination of an additive, constituent, or other component
7 of a tobacco product because it is or may be harmful.¹⁸ In March 2018, the FDA issued two
8 advance notices of proposed rulemaking, one to explore a product standard to lower nicotine in
9 cigarettes to minimally or non-addictive levels and the other calling on stakeholders to share data,
10 research, and information to inform the role that flavors play in initiation, use, and cessation of
11 tobacco products.
12

13 Reducing cigarettes' addictiveness could potentially help addicted users quit more easily and help
14 keep those who are experimenting from becoming regular smokers.² While the FDA's current plan
15 does not include lowering nicotine levels in non-combustible tobacco products, conceptually the
16 availability of potentially less harmful tobacco products could reduce risk while delivering levels of
17 nicotine for adults who still want it.²
18

19 E-CIGARETTES AND HARM REDUCTION 20

21 In January 2018, the National Academies issued a report on the "Public Health Consequences of E-
22 cigarettes." The report committee undertook a comprehensive review of the scientific literature
23 regarding key constituents in e-cigarettes, human health effects, initiation and cessation of
24 combustible tobacco cigarette use, and harm reduction.
25

26 In addressing harm reduction, the National Academies noted the absence of randomized controlled
27 trials and longitudinal observational studies on the effects of switching from combustible tobacco
28 cigarettes to e-cigarettes to reduce harm.⁵ Therefore, they relied on evidence regarding the
29 exposure to toxicants present in e-cigarette aerosols compared with those in cigarette smoke,
30 nicotine and toxicant exposures in e-cigarette users as an intermediate outcome, and comparisons
31 of health effects on any health outcome from e-cigarette use compared with combustible tobacco
32 cigarette smoking.⁵
33

34 Based on a limited number of laboratory studies comparing emissions of harmful and potentially
35 harmful chemicals from e-cigarette devices with those from combustible tobacco cigarettes, aerosol
36 emitted from e-cigarettes is substantially less complex than tobacco smoke.⁵ Several potentially
37 toxic substances have been identified in e-cigarette aerosol, but at significantly lower levels than in
38 combustible tobacco smoke.⁵ The National Academies found that "there is conclusive evidence that
39 completely substituting e-cigarettes for combustible tobacco cigarettes reduces users' exposure to
40 numerous toxicants and carcinogens present in combustible tobacco cigarettes."⁵
41

42 While the health effects of using e-cigarettes are not well understood, current evidence points to e-
43 cigarettes being less harmful than combustible tobacco cigarettes.⁵ All but one of the studies
44 reviewed by the National Academies showed significant short-term improvements in health
45 outcomes in smokers who switched from combustible tobacco cigarettes to e-cigarettes.⁵ Thus, they
46 concluded that "there is substantial evidence that completely switching from regular use of
47 combustible tobacco cigarettes to e-cigarettes results in reduced short-term adverse health
48 outcomes in several organ systems."⁵

1 Dual use of tobacco cigarettes and e-cigarettes is highly prevalent among adults and youth but little
2 evidence exists about dual users' patterns of use. On dual use, the National Academies concluded
3 that, "there is no available evidence whether or not long-term e-cigarette use among smokers (dual
4 use) changes morbidity or mortality compared with those who only smoke combustible tobacco
5 cigarettes" and "there is insufficient evidence that e-cigarette use changes short-term adverse health
6 outcomes in several organ systems in smokers who continue to smoke combustible tobacco
7 cigarettes (dual users)."⁵

8
9 No long-term studies exist comparing the health effects resulting from passive exposure to
10 secondhand aerosol from e-cigarettes with effects in non-smokers passively exposed to tobacco
11 smoke.⁵ A limited number of studies compared secondhand exposure to e-cigarette emissions to
12 combustible tobacco cigarette smoke.⁵ While e-cigarette use in indoor environments exposes non-
13 users to nicotine and particulates, it is at lower levels compared to tobacco smoke from
14 combustible cigarettes.⁵ The National Academies concluded that, "there is moderate evidence that
15 secondhand exposure to nicotine and particulates is lower from e-cigarettes compared with
16 combustible tobacco cigarettes."⁵

17 18 CURRENT USE PATTERNS

19
20 In 2013 and 2014, more than a quarter (27.6 percent) of adults were current users of at least one
21 type of tobacco product.¹⁹ A total of 8.9 percent of youths had used a tobacco product in the
22 previous 30 days and 1.6 percent of youths were daily users. Approximately 40 percent of tobacco
23 users used multiple tobacco products, with cigarettes plus e-cigarettes as the most common
24 combination.¹⁹ Although consumption of combustible tobacco products has decreased, the
25 consumption of non-cigarette combustible tobacco and smokeless tobacco has increased.²⁰

26
27 In 2014, 12.6 percent of adults had ever tried an e-cigarette (at least one time) and 3.7 percent of
28 adults currently used e-cigarettes.¹⁶ In 2016, 20.2 percent of surveyed high school students and 7.2
29 percent of middle school students reported current tobacco product use.²¹ E-cigarettes are the most
30 commonly used tobacco product among high (11.3 percent) and middle (4.3 percent) school
31 students.²¹ In 2018, health officials raised concerns about Juul, a brand of e-cigarette that looks like
32 a flash drive.²² The devices are difficult to distinguish from a real flash drive and their vapor
33 dissipates quickly making them easy to hide. Each Juul cartridge lasts about 200 puffs and has as
34 much nicotine as an entire pack of cigarettes. "Juuling" has become widespread enough that school
35 districts in several states have voiced concerns and, in some cases, have amended school policy to
36 address the issue.²³

37
38 Use of e-cigarettes, hookah, non-cigarette combustible tobacco, or smokeless tobacco by youth is
39 associated with cigarette smoking one year later.²⁴ Furthermore, the risk of progressing to
40 conventional cigarette smoking is increased with use of multiple forms of non-cigarette tobacco,
41 suggesting that novel tobacco products have the potential to undermine public health gains in
42 combatting the smoking epidemic.²⁴ Among adolescent cigarette experimenters, using e-cigarettes
43 has been positively and independently associated with progression to current established smoking,
44 suggesting that e-cigarettes may encourage cigarette smoking in this population.²⁵ E-cigarette use
45 among youth and young adults is a public health concern, and coordinated efforts are needed to
46 protect young people from a lifetime of nicotine addiction.²⁶

47 48 SMOKING CESSATION

49
50 The United States Preventive Services Task Force (USPSTF) recommends that clinicians ask all
51 adults about tobacco use, advise them to stop using tobacco, provide behavioral interventions and

1 offer FDA-approved pharmacotherapy for cessation to adults who use tobacco.²⁷ In 2015, 68
2 percent of adults smokers wanted to quit smoking, 57 percent had been advised by a health
3 professional to quit, and 31 percent had used cessation counseling and/or medications when trying
4 to quit.²⁸ Fewer than one-third of persons used evidenced-based cessation methods when trying to
5 quit smoking.²⁸ To enhance cessation rates, health care providers should consistently identify
6 smokers, advise them to quit, and promote the use of evidenced-based cessation treatments.²⁸

7
8 The USPSTF also examined the evidence on the use of e-cigarettes or ENDS and concluded that
9 the current evidence is insufficient to recommend ENDS for tobacco cessation in adults, including
10 pregnant women.²⁷ Furthermore, a large prospective study of recently hospitalized smokers
11 (n=1357) who planned to quit found a negative association between the use of e-cigarettes after
12 discharge and subsequent tobacco abstinence.²⁹ Not only does the intermittent and concurrent use
13 of e-cigarettes with other cessation aids not aid quitting, it may hamper it.²⁹ The USPSTF
14 recommends that clinicians direct patients who smoke tobacco to cessation interventions with
15 established effectiveness and safety.²⁷

16 17 CONCLUSION

18
19 Despite reductions in combustible tobacco use, it still represents the leading cause of preventable
20 death in the United States. A growing number of non-combustible tobacco products are thought to
21 be less hazardous than combustibles, but limited evidence is available on their long-term health
22 risks. The FDA has the authority to designate products as MRTP, but to date, no products have met
23 the criteria and been approved through this pathway.

24
25 E-cigarettes are among the most widely used non-combustible tobacco products. Available
26 evidence suggests that those who completely substitute e-cigarettes for combustible tobacco
27 cigarettes have reduced exposure to numerous toxicants and carcinogens present in combustible
28 tobacco cigarettes, resulting in reduced short-term adverse health outcomes in several organ
29 systems. However, long-term studies on the health effects of e-cigarettes are lacking. Furthermore,
30 the efficacy of e-cigarettes in reducing health risks has not been adequately evaluated in well-
31 designed epidemiological studies and RCTs. Benefits are not realized in dual users, who in fact
32 may be exposed to additional adverse health effects.

33
34 Significant concerns exist that novel, non-combustible products may pose a significant threat to
35 tobacco cessation and prevention efforts. Smokers concerned about their health who see the claims
36 for novel tobacco products may think that a safer cigarette genuinely exists, making them less
37 inclined to try to quit smoking. Furthermore, ex-smokers may start smoking again, thinking they
38 can now safely consume tobacco products. Likewise, those who never used tobacco products may
39 initiate tobacco use assuming that a safe tobacco product exists. E-cigarette use among youth and
40 young adults is a public health concern. Available data suggest that youth who use e-cigarettes are
41 more likely to smoke combustible cigarettes.

42
43 Evidence-based methods for tobacco cessation exist. The FDA has approved several smoking
44 cessation products designed to help users gradually withdraw from smoking by using specific
45 amounts of nicotine that decrease over time. The USPSTF has reviewed the evidence and
46 recommends that clinicians ask all adults about tobacco use, advise them to stop using tobacco,
47 provide behavioral interventions, and offer FDA approved pharmacotherapy for cessation to adults
48 who use tobacco. More needs to be done to promote evidence-based cessation methods to those
49 who are trying to quit smoking.

1 RECOMMENDATIONS

2
3 The Council recommends that the following statements be adopted in lieu of Resolution 403-A-17,
4 and the remainder of the report be filed.

5
6 1. That Policy H-495.988, "FDA Regulation of Tobacco Products," be amended by addition and
7 deletion to read as follows:

8
9 H-495.988 FDA Regulation of Tobacco Products

10 1. Our AMA: (A) ~~reaffirms its position~~ acknowledges that all tobacco products (including but
11 not limited to, cigarettes, smokeless tobacco, chewing tobacco, and hookah/water pipe tobacco)
12 are harmful to health, and that there is no such thing as a safe cigarette; (B) recognizes that
13 currently available evidence from short-term studies points to electronic cigarettes as
14 containing fewer toxicants than combustible cigarettes, but the use of electronic cigarettes is
15 not harmless and is associated with increases youth risk of the using of combustible tobacco
16 cigarettes in youth; (C) encourages long-term studies of vaping (the use of electronic nicotine
17 delivery systems) and recognizes that complete cessation of the use of tobacco and nicotine-
18 related products is the goal; (D) ~~B~~ asserts that tobacco is a raw form of the drug nicotine and
19 that tobacco products are delivery devices for an addictive substance; (E) ~~E~~ reaffirms its
20 position that the Food and Drug Administration (FDA) does ~~have~~, and should continue to have,
21 authority to regulate tobacco products, including their manufacture, sale, distribution, and
22 marketing; (F) ~~D~~ strongly supports the substance of the August 1996 FDA regulations intended
23 to reduce use of tobacco by children and adolescents as sound public health policy and opposes
24 any federal legislative proposal that would weaken the proposed FDA regulations; (G) ~~E~~ urges
25 Congress to pass legislation to phase in the production of less hazardous and less toxic tobacco,
26 and to authorize the FDA have broad-based powers to regulate tobacco products; (H) ~~F~~
27 encourages the FDA and other appropriate agencies to conduct or fund research on
28 how tobacco products might be modified to facilitate cessation of use, including
29 elimination of nicotine and elimination of additives (e.g., ammonia) that enhance
30 addictiveness; and (I) ~~G~~ strongly opposes legislation which would undermine the FDA's
31 authority to regulate tobacco products and encourages state medical associations to contact
32 their state delegations to oppose legislation which would undermine the FDA's authority to
33 regulate tobacco products... (Amend Current HOD Policy)

34
35 2. That Policy H-495.972, "Electronic Cigarettes, Vaping, and Health: 2014 Update," be amended
36 by addition and deletion to read as follows, with a change in title:

37
38 ~~Electronic Cigarettes, Vaping, and Health: 2014 Update~~

39 1. Our AMA urges physicians to: (a) educate themselves about electronic nicotine delivery
40 systems (ENDS), including e-cigarettes, be prepared to counsel patients about the use of these
41 products and the potential for nicotine addiction and the potential hazards of dual use with
42 conventional cigarettes, and be sensitive to the possibility that when patients ask about e-
43 cigarettes, they may be asking for help to quit smoking; (b) consider expanding clinical
44 interviews to inquire about "vaping" or the use of e-cigarettes; (c) promote the use of FDA-
45 approved smoking cessation tools and resources for their patients and caregivers; and (d)
46 advise patients who use e-cigarettes to take measures to assure the safety of children in the
47 home who could be exposed to risks of nicotine overdose via ingestion of replacement e-
48 cigarette liquid that is capped or stored improperly. 2. Our AMA: (a) encourages further
49 clinical and epidemiological research on e-cigarettes-; 3. Our AMA (b) supports education of
50 the public on the health effects, including toxins and carcinogens of electronic nicotine delivery
51 systems (ENDS) including e-cigarettes-; and (c) recognizes that the use of products containing

1 nicotine in any form among youth, including e-cigarettes, is unsafe and can cause addiction.
2 (Amend Current HOD Policy)
3

4 3. That Policy H-495.973, “FDA to Extend Regulatory Jurisdiction Over All Non- Pharmaceutical
5 Nicotine and Tobacco Products,” be amended by addition and deletion to read as follows:

6 H-495.973 FDA to Extend Regulatory Jurisdiction Over All Non-Pharmaceutical Nicotine and
7 Tobacco Products

8 Our AMA: (1) supports the U.S. Food and Drug Administration's (FDA) proposed rule that
9 would implement its deeming authority allowing the agency to extend FDA regulation of
10 tobacco products to pipes, cigars, hookahs, e-cigarettes and all other non-pharmaceutical
11 tobacco/nicotine products not currently covered by the Federal Food, Drug, and Cosmetic Act,
12 as amended by the Family Smoking Prevention and Tobacco Control Act; and (2) supports
13 legislation and/or regulation of electronic cigarettes and all other non-pharmaceutical
14 tobacco/nicotine products that: (a) establishes a minimum legal purchasing age of ~~18~~21; (b)
15 prohibits use in all places that tobacco cigarette use is prohibited, including in hospitals and
16 other places in which health care is delivered; (c) applies the same marketing and sales
17 restrictions that are applied to tobacco cigarettes, including prohibitions on television
18 advertising, product placement in television and films, and the use of celebrity spokespeople;
19 (d) prohibits product claims of reduced risk or effectiveness as tobacco cessation tools, until
20 such time that credible evidence is available, evaluated, and supported by the FDA; (e) requires
21 the use of secure, child- and tamper-proof packaging and design, and safety labeling on
22 containers of replacement fluids (e-liquids) used in e-cigarettes; (f) establishes manufacturing
23 and product (including e-liquids) standards for identity, strength, purity, packaging, and
24 labeling with instructions and contraindications for use; (g) requires transparency and
25 disclosure concerning product design, contents, and emissions; and (h) prohibits the use of
26 characterizing flavors that may enhance the appeal of such products to youth. (Amend Current
27 HOD Policy)
28

29 4. That Policy, H-490.917, “Physician Responsibilities for Tobacco Cessation” be reaffirmed.
30 (Reaffirm HOD Policy)

Fiscal Note: less than \$500

REFERENCES

1. Henningfield J, Hammond K. Tobacco: deadly in any form or disguise. World Health Organization. Available at http://www.who.int/tobacco/communications/events/wntd/2006/Tfi_Rapport.pdf. Accessed April 2, 2018.
2. Gottlieb S, Zeller M. A Nicotine-Focused Framework for Public Health. *N Engl J Med*. 2017;377:1111-1114.
3. Proctor RN. Why ban the sale of cigarettes? The case for abolition. *Tob Control*. 2013;22 Suppl 1:i27-i30.
4. Zeller M, Hatsukami D. The Strategic Dialogue on Tobacco Harm Reduction: a vision and blueprint for action in the US. *Tob Control*. 2009;18:324-332.
5. National Academies of Sciences, Engineering and Medicine. Public Health Consequences of E-Cigarettes. January 23, 2018. Available at <http://nationalacademies.org/hmd/Reports/2018/public-health-consequences-of-e-cigarettes.aspx>. Accessed April 2, 2018.
6. Cahn Z, Siegel M. Electronic cigarettes as a harm reduction strategy for tobacco control: a step forward or a repeat of past mistakes? *J Public Health Policy*. 2011;32:16-31.
7. Shopland DR. Historical perspective: the low tar lie. *Tob Control*. 2001;10 Suppl 1:i1-i3.
8. Institute of Medicine. Clearing the Smoke: Assessing the Science Base for Tobacco Harm Reduction. 2001. Available at <https://www.nap.edu/catalog/10029/clearing-the-smoke-assessing-the-science-base-for-tobacco-harm>. Accessed April 2, 2018.
9. Gray N, Henningfield JE, Benowitz NL et al. Toward a comprehensive long term nicotine policy. *Tob Control*. 2005;14:161-165.
10. Zeller M. Reflections on the 'endgame' for tobacco control. *Tob Control*. 2013;22 Suppl 1:i40-i41.
11. Food and Drug Administration. Want to Quit Smoking? FDA-Approved Products Can Help. Available at <https://www.fda.gov/ForConsumers/ConsumerUpdates/ucm198176.htm>. Accessed April 2, 2018.
12. Food and Drug Administration. Modified Risk Tobacco Products. Available at <https://www.fda.gov/TobaccoProducts/Labeling/TobaccoProductReviewEvaluation/ucm304465.htm>. Accessed April 2, 2018.
13. Food and Drug Administration, Tobacco Product Safety Advisory Committee. Minutes from the January 24-25, 2018 Meeting. Available at <https://www.fda.gov/downloads/AdvisoryCommittees/CommitteesMeetingMaterials/TobaccoProductsScientificAdvisoryCommittee/UCM599236.pdf>. Accessed April 2, 2018.
14. Zhu SH, Zhuang YL, Wong S, Cummins SE, Tedeschi GJ. E-cigarette use and associated changes in population smoking cessation: evidence from US current population surveys. *BMJ*. 2017;358:j3262.
15. American Lung Association. What's in a Cigarette? Available at <http://www.lung.org/stop-smoking/smoking-facts/whats-in-a-cigarette.html>. Accessed April 2, 2018.
16. Centers for Disease Control and Prevention. Fact Sheet: Health Effects of Cigarette Smoking. Available at https://www.cdc.gov/tobacco/data_statistics/fact_sheets/health_effects/effects_cig_smoking/index.htm. Accessed April 2, 2018.
17. Pub.L. 111-31, H.R. 1256. 2018.
18. Federal Food, Drug, and Cosmetic Act, § 907.
19. Kasza KA, Ambrose BK, Conway KP et al. Tobacco-Product Use by Adults and Youths in the United States in 2013 and 2014. *N Engl J Med*. 2017;376:342-353.

20. Wang TW, Kenemer B, Tynan MA, Singh T, King B. Consumption of Combustible and Smokeless Tobacco - United States, 2000-2015. *MMWR*. 2016;65:1357-1363.
21. Jamal A, Gentzke A, Hu SS et al. Tobacco Use Among Middle and High School Students - United States, 2011-2016. *MMWR*. 2017;66:597-603.
22. Delaware Health and Social Services, DPH Advises Parents, Teachers of New E-Cigarette Trend Among Teens: JUULing. Available at <https://news.delaware.gov/2018/04/12/dph-advises-parents-teachers-new-e-cigarette-trend-among-teens-juuling/>. Accessed April 18, 2018.
23. Ducharme J. Teens Are 'Juuling' At School. Here's What That Means. *Time Health*. March 27, 2018. Available at <http://time.com/5211536/what-is-juuling/>. Accessed April 18, 2018.
24. Watkins SL, Glantz SA, Chaffee BW. Association of Noncigarette Tobacco Product Use With Future Cigarette Smoking Among Youth in the Population Assessment of Tobacco and Health (PATH) Study, 2013-2015. *JAMA Pediatr*. 2018;172:181-187.
25. Chaffee BW, Watkins SL, Glantz SA. Electronic Cigarette Use and Progression From Experimentation to Established Smoking. *Pediatrics*. 2018;141.
26. U.S. Department of Health and Human Services, E-cigarette Use Among Youth and Young Adults: A Report of the Surgeon General. Rockville, MD. 2016.
27. U.S. Preventive Services Task Force. Final Recommendation Statement, Tobacco Smoking Cessation in Adults, Including Pregnant Women: Behavioral and Pharmacotherapy Interventions. Available at <https://www.uspreventiveservicestaskforce.org/Page/Document/RecommendationStatementFinal/tobacco-use-in-adults-and-pregnant-women-counseling-and-interventions1>. Accessed April 18, 2018.
28. Babb S, Malarcher A, Schauer G AK, Jamal A. Quitting Smoking Among Adults - United States, 2000-2015. *MMWR*. 2017;65:1457-1464.
29. Rigotti NA, Chang Y, Tindle HA et al. Association of E-Cigarette Use With Smoking Cessation Among Smokers Who Plan to Quit After a Hospitalization: A Prospective Study. *Ann Intern Med*. 2018.